

VERBATIM NOTES OF THE PUBLIC PRESENTATION ON THE  
PROPOSED WHIM ESTATES HOUSING DEVELOPMENT, OLD  
HARBOUR, ST. CATHERINE BY THE WHIM DEVELOPMENT  
COMPANY LIMITED HELD AT THE OLD HARBOUR HIGH  
SCHOOL 33 SOUTH STREET, OLD HARBOUR,  
ST. CATHERINE ON TUESDAY, APRIL 16, 2019  
COMMENCING AT 6:50 P.M.

**PRESENT WERE:** See attendance register attached

The Chairman: Ladies and gentlemen, good evening.

Residents: Good evening.

The Chairman: I am beginning with an apology. I actually entered Lafe Street 45 minutes ago, and it took me 45 minutes to get through Lafe street, and to get on to the Old Harbour Bay Main Road. I entered Lafe Street 45 minutes ago, and I have never seen traffic

like that. So, I apologize for the late start and we will move quickly ahead.

We are here for the public presentation on the proposed Whim Estate Housing Development in Old Harbour, and we will proceed as we had prayers done already.

**(Mrs. Sandra Nembhard prayed, earlier)**

So I welcome you all to the discourse and I am here as the facilitator of the discourse which means that I will be having you - giving you all a fair chance to voice your opinions after we have heard a statement from NEPA and a presentation by Mr. Richard Coutou, then we will go into the question and answer period, and I will be your facilitator.

When we get to that section, I am going to ask you, when you stand, to ask a question to identify the group that you represent and then you proceed to ask your questions. And everyone will be given a fair opportunity to have their voices heard.

So, having done the prayer, and having extended to you a warm welcome and, to what we hope will be a very productive evening; I am going to invite Mrs. Ruth-Ann Lacey-Sherrard from NEPA to come to make an opening statement by NEPA. Could you put your hands together and welcome her?

(Applause)

Mrs. Lacey-Sherrard: Good evening again everyone. This is a mandatory statement from the National Environment and Planning Agency at this public presentation,

for the Environmental Impact Assessment for a subdivision and housing development at Whim Pen Old Harbour St. Catherine, by Whim Development Company Limited.

On the 10<sup>th</sup> of April 2018, the Whim Development Company Limited applied for an Environmental Permit with reference number 201814017 EP 00131 for division and housing at Whim Pen Old Harbour.

The proposed project is proposed to consist of the subdivision of lands and the constructing of 876 residential units along with supporting amenities, a water treatment plant, water treatment and storage facilities.

The information submitted in support of the application was reviewed and a decision arrive at that an

Environmental Impact Assessment would be required for the project.

A Terms of Reference for the EIA was drafted and subsequently accepted.

A draft EIA report was submitted to NEPA in October 2018, where it was reviewed and the Whim Development Company Limited was provided with the agency's comments in response dated the 5<sup>th</sup> of December 2018.

A revised EIA report was submitted in February 2019. Amendments were subsequently made to the EIA report based on the agency's comments and a revised EIA report was subsequently accepted by the agency on the 15<sup>th</sup> of March 2019.

The accepted EIA was circulated for comments to the National Works Agency, the Jamaica National Heritage Trust, the Agricultural Land

Management Division, the Water Resource Authority, the Office of Disaster Preparedness and Emergency Management, Mines and Geology Division, the St. Catherine Municipal Corporation.

The document was also posted for the public viewing at the St. Catherine Municipal Corporation, the NEPA Documentation Center, the Old Harbour Library, and the Old Harbour Police Station.

The electronic version of the document can also be viewed on the website of NEPA as well as ESL.

Note that this public meeting is a preliminary action and no final decision has yet been made.

Notification of this public meeting was advertised in the Daily Observer on the 25<sup>th</sup> of March 2019, the 28<sup>th</sup> of

March 2019, the 1<sup>st</sup> of April 2019, as well as the 8<sup>th</sup> of April 2019. Participants should note that this public meeting is deemed important and the outcome from the meeting will be submitted to the Natural Resources Conservation Authority to guide the decision-making process.

The Agency representatives are present to support the process and to ensure that the public presentation is undertaken in accordance with the terms outlined in document titled: General Guideline for Public Consultation, EIA Applications.

As a regulator the Agency must remain objective and as such, the team will not participate in making comments or answering questions in relation to the Development.

Of note too is the process with respect to the public presentation, and the Agency wishes to highlight the following with respect to the public meeting.

A copy of the verbatim minutes of the public consultation is to be submitted to the agency by the applicant within 7 days of the date of this meeting.

The public is allowed up to 21 days after this meeting to provide written comments to the Agency.

All comments received by the Agency will be collated and sent to the applicant for responses to be provided.

The issues raised along with the responses provided by the applicant are incorporated in the respective submission to the various committees



and authorities and will facilitate deliberation on the technical merit of the project.

A recommendation will then be made to the NRCA which is the body responsible for making the final decision.

Please note carefully, the final decision is that of the NRCA.

Written comments shall be sent to 10 Caledonia Avenue, Kingston 5 or via electronic mail at applications@nepa.gov.jm sorry let me repeat that 10 Caledonia Avenue Kingston 5, or applications@nepa.gov.jm. Again, the agency views this public presentation as the process as extremely important in the processing and decision-making process.

Please be reminded that the EIA Report, finally, is available for

access by the public at the following locations:

The St Catherine Municipal Corporation, the NEPA Documentation Center, the Old Harbour Library, the Old Harbour Police Station, the NEPA's website at [www.nepa.gov.jm](http://www.nepa.gov.jm) and the Environmental Solutions Limited Website at [www.eslcaribbean.com](http://www.eslcaribbean.com)  
Thank you. (Applause)

The Chairman: Before we have the presentation by the Environment Solutions Limited, ESL, I would like to introduce to you some members of their team. I will ask the person when I call their names to stand and be recognized.

Of course, we have Mr. Richard Coutou, he is the Geologist and Environmental Analyst, we have Annmarie Goulbourne, Annmarie is the Senior Environmental Analyst, then we Abigail McIntosh,

Abigail is also a Senior Environmental Analyst, then we have Rashidah Khan-Haqq, she is a Senior Environmental Chemist and a Director at ESL.

We also welcome Dr. Arpita Mandal, she is a Hydro-geologist. Then we have Brandon Hay, not here an Ecologist from ESL, and Bruce Donaldson, a Developer.

I repeat we will have now the presentation by Mr. Richard Coutou, we will have the entire presentation done, and then we will facilitate comments and questions afterwards.

I will direct the proceedings after that. And I am confident that we will have a productive evening as we give opportunity by expression by the citizens. Mr Coutou. (Applause)

Mr. Coutou: Thank you very much, Chairman. I would also like to apologize for the late start, and I am aware that they are doing some road works or some paving on South Street and that has contributed to the traffic.

Alright, so I will begin with a short introduction, then the purpose for the EIA for the Whim Estates. I will discuss the project for the Whim Estate Housing Development and showing you the features of the Development.

I will discuss the methodology and approach that we took for conducting the Environmental Impact Assessment. I will discuss the environment and the state of the environment. This is the environment as it is today or late last year when we completed the Environment Impact Assessment. And we

will discuss the potential impacts that the project may have on the environment or *vice versa*. And we will consider some alternatives and then have a conclusion.

Environmental Solutions was contracted by the Whim Development Company Limited to undertake this this Environmental Impact Assessment. Environment Solutions Limited is an Environmental Consultancy and we conduct solutions on behalf of - assessments on behalf of developers.

The EIA really is done to identify new risks and opportunities that the Development may have. We also look at what consequences or impacts that development may have on the environment or that the environment may have on the development. And with that information we develop

mitigation measures to eliminate any of these impacts.

So Whim Development Company proposes to undertake a two phase residential housing development on seventy hectares of land which is situated in Old Harbour, and just if you are not from Old Harbour, as you come South Street, there is New Harbour Village One, New Harbour Village Two, and New Harbour Village Three.

The Whim Development is on the western side of New Harbour Village Two.

From the St Catherine Development Order, the Whim Estate is actually proposed as residential or the area is proposed for residential development in the St. Catherine Development Order, 2017.

The project will see the construction of 876 housing units, some will be two

bedrooms, one bathroom and the others will be two bedrooms, two bathrooms.

The Development will also have a community centre, playing field, independent water supply, independent sewage facility and it will also undertake widening and realignment of the Bower's Gully.

Units will be constructed with cast-in-place technology, and this is what typically it will look like; and these are the two layouts, two bedrooms, actually it has two bedrooms, two bathrooms with a rear on a side carport, while the two bedroom, one bathrooms have a side carport as well. And just some views of the housing development as well.

**(Referring to slide)**

So, the main components of the project; one is the realignment of the

Bower's Gully, north of Highway 2000 the Bower's Gully has been realigned twice before to allow for the construction of the Avery and for the construction of New Harbour Village 4. And so, after the construction of the Whim Estates they will have to do some further realignment of the Bower's Gully. It will move from 10 meters wide at the current state, and up to 50 meters wide to ensure that the holding capacity during flood events. And also, it has a retention pond and while the retention pond is not required by NWA, it will be placed there in order to decrease flow as well as decrease sediment flows during periods of high run-off.

Another main component of the project is that currently the estate has an NIC canal- a defunct NIC canal running through it. That will be realigned



away from the property and it can actually be reconstructed so that it will be able to be used again.

Utilities and infrastructure; potable water will come from a well situated on Whim Estates and Whim Development Company already has an abstracts and licenses from the WRA for this well, and the water will be treated for portable use.

A waste water treatment plant will be south of the Whim Estates and it will treat the water to an appropriate level, or the standards required by NEPA.

The Estate will have a network of drainage to ensure that no flooding or run off on the site occurs in a manner which will prevent any flooding or disruption to the Estate and internal roads also to ensure that

there is free flow of traffic throughout the Estate.

Currently, there are four main access routes into the Estate one through New Harbour Village Two, the road reserve to New Harbour Village Two on the north, there is a South access also through New Harbour Village Two, a south road reserve. There is also access through a parochial road going south, heading to Old Harbour Bay and there is a road from Free Town.

During construction phase, for the project, access will be through the parochial road from Free Town, to minimise and disruption and to ensure that there is not disruption to this Old Harbour area.

When the Development is in operation, main access will be through the south

to Whim Estates through the south road reserve from South Street.

The project schedule will be completed in two phases: Phase one will see a completion of 556 units in about a year to year and half; and phase two will be completed after two to three years with a completion of 320 units. The development is constructed in such a way that phase one will be able to open before phase two is completed.

Approach for conducting the EIA. The ESL teams conducted several meetings and interaction with professionals to get a better understanding or to make a better assessment with the environment. With all of the background research, on previous EIAs, with previous projects in the

area, and we undertook field assessment throughout the area.

We used this data we analyse this data to see if there are any impacts or if there will be a potential impact, as well as if there are any mitigation measures.

Typically, we use a radius of one kilometre - in this case we use a radius of almost three kilometres for our zone of influence for the Whim Estates.

So, the description of the environment, generally the land at the Whim Estate is flat, it is about 21 meters above sea level at the highest point about northwest of the - sorry northeast of the property and to the southwest it is lowest which is 12 meters above sea level. It is gentle slope in gradient. There are

no hills, not a mountainous area and so there is run off generally from the northeast to the southwest. The geology of the area is typically coarse gravels to sandy silts and clays, it is the typical geology in South St. Catherine, and this was formed from the Rio Cobre sediments. The sediments on the St. Catherine plains thickness is between 20 meters to 300 meters. Underneath the alluvium deposits there are limestone, these are white or paled limestone sometimes it is up to 300 meters thick and this is actually where the potable water comes from.

The soil in the area which derives from the underline alluvium, so they tend to be similar, they are clayey, silty horizons and sometimes sand horizons, and sometimes those sand horizons actually act as small

aquifers and some people do pump water from it, where they get a license.

The hydrology and drainage in the area. The Bower's Gully in the main drainage in this area. The Whim Estates falls in the Bower's Gully watershed. The Bower's Gully is actually the main drainage system or the main drain in the area, it is part of the wider Rio Cobre watershed.

The sub-surface hydrology here has four aquifers or four hydrographic units in the area and this is used to define where water will come from, or where potable water will come from. The basal aquiclude is in the North of St. Catherine and below that we have the limestone aquifer which actually underlies the alluvium aquifer.

The Whim Estate is probably right where I have the pointer and so even though it appears on the alluvium aquifer and all these little dots here are wells which pump water, potable water even though all of them seem to be in the alluvium aquifer; they are actually deep enough which gets into the limestone aquifer for pumping water. So, all of these wells actually come from below the alluvium.

Surface Water- water quality one of the issues is the surface water in general, and so we took three water samples, one in the Lower Bower's Gully and close to the coastline, one just south of the Whim Estates, and one at a drain which separates the Whim Estates from New Harbour Village Two. Generally, water samples one and two, had high total suspended solids, and that is because compared to the

third sample this flowing rivers or flowing streams is a little more turbid while three had lot of vegetation and the water was a little more stagnant.

Sample three, had a high biological oxygen demand and this indicates some organics in the water. It also has high nitrates and high coliform and bacteria which suggests some contamination from human source or human sources. Sample two, also have high salinity, and high dissolved oxygen, this is because the sample was close to the coast, therefore there was a lot of sea water intrusion going up the stream and they were actually some animals, marine animals, and stingrays.

For air quality we did five samples in the area, one sample for air



quality was higher than the required standard and that was sample two which was taken from the border of New Harbour Village two and Whim Estates. On the Whim Estate there was no clear identification where any suspended particles should be coming from or PM loading should be appearing. So, we actually looked at the developments next door and believe the sediments are being transported across by the wind.

For noise, all noise levels are below the required standard except point six which is close to the highway; so those noise levels were caused by the Highway 2000 to the north side of the community.

Ecological, an ecological assessment was completed, there were no habitat zones. The area is considered to be

ruinate agricultural lands or abandoned agricultural lands, so this area was mostly sugar cane before and has been abandoned, no sugar cane is there anymore it is just overgrown lands. And there are no areas of ecological importance where the area is, and no endemic species were observed on the site.

The project, however, does fall in the Portland Bight Protected Area. However, it is not located in any area that has been determined to be sensitive or in any area that is zoned for any special sort of protection. So, this is the Portland Bight Protected Area and it is just on the boundary of the area.

We also did some socio-economic assessment in the area, and the PIOJ in the population census for 2011,

indicated the population in Old Harbour is actually around 23,600 persons in 2011. And this is slightly much lower than the projected for Old Harbour without housing developments. So, the area is not growing as fast as they are expected it to grow, and so the population is still below the 2015 levels without major housing developments in the area.

The area does have electrical supply, both high voltage and low voltage supply from JPS. It does have NWC water supply and sufficient ground water supply to accommodate future housing developments. They have both wire and wireless communication network systems in the area and the roads consist of a Main Road, South Street which links Old Harbour to Old Harbour Bay. There is Highway 2000 with on and off ramps, just South of

Old Harbour or just North of New Harbour Village Two and there are several parochial roads which links the project site to main roads.

There is a public transportation system, taxis do service the area, as well as, the JUTC buses which provide services in the area. And Solid Waste Management in the area is managed under National Solid Waste Management Authority currently.

The area is also within - Whim Estate is also less than five minutes from the Old Harbour Fire Station; from the Old Harbour Police Station and from the Old Harbour Health Center. The nearest hospital is the Spanish Town Hospital, which can be about twenty minutes away.

We also discussed public perception. And we did as a survey of 200 persons

in the nearby communities included Old Harbour, Old Harbour Bay, Morse Pen, New Harbour Village Two, New Harbour Village One and Three. 75 per cent of respondents perceived the project to be good or very good; 79 per cent also believe it to be necessary in the area. Generally, most people prefer - think this is good because the proximity to and it is takes generally about an hour to get to Kingston.

Respondents believe the project will bring benefits such as employment, access to housing and increase business sales, typically businesses and sales from persons in Old Harbour or and vendors in Old Harbour.

Respondents also fear that it may encourage crime, it may increase more noise levels, and they were concerned

about changes in land use in the area and the affordability of homes.

81 per cent, however, believes that the project will not be disruptive to the community surroundings.

We also interviewed key stakeholders and some of them include the fire service which had no problem with large housing projects, and actually they encourage the housing projects because it actually reduces the amount of bush fires, they have to respond to. And when we asked them about house fires, they said most of the public is educated and so they actually respond to more bush fires than fires related to houses.

The Old Harbour Health Center has indicated that they have seen a big increase in the number of persons using their health centre and so a

larger population may be a challenge, but however, they are aware of plans for a new health centre for Old Harbour.

National Solid Waste Management Authority does solid waste collection in the area once every nine days even though the schedule should be once every seven days, and the activity delayed due to lack of contractors to do collection. And so, they have indicated that a development would also contribute - may contribute further delays to the collection system.

WRA indicated that they have a rigorous process for allowing license for the abstraction of water and this process test for good quality and quantity.

And New Harbour Village Two, we also met with them and they indicated that they do have some concerns and it include the sewage, water supply and site access.

So, with that information, we looked at the project and try to identify any potential impacts and may propose mitigation measures.

Now, we have divided the impacts into two, construction phase impacts, so these are impacts that might occur during construction.

And the operational impacts, and that is when the construction is completed, and the housing development is in operation.

So, for air quality, one potential impact might be fugitive dusts from the construction activity, and this might have health impacts on the



workers as well as nearby communities. And so mitigation methods we proposed in cases where impact occurs will be periodic wetting of the area, ensuring that the developments or lands are clear on a phased process, so to use the area that it should be cleared and any areas that is cleared should be paved or wet if it is going to be a road, the road should be paved and not left as dirt roads. There should be adequate lands paved in around the property and dust screens and vegetation buffers should be used.

Impacts due to site erosion; again, erosion may occur due to clearing of the land, and this may increase sediment runoff into the gullies. And so again, phased clearing and the use of clearing screens as well as

development of a site clearing plan and a phased approach to clearing.

Noise impacts may occur from the construction activities and may impact both the workmen on the site and in various communities.

Mitigation measures include adhering to noise standards, advising communities of any planned elevated noise levels, use of noise abatement plan, use of noise barriers and the use of properly maintained equipment to reduce noise.

A work schedule should also be required as well as protective equipment for workers.

In terms of water quality, there may be increased surface runoffs, increase contamination from sewage, from surface runoff or disruption of surface runoffs, or changes in the

hydrological flow. And so some of the mitigation measures will be to ensure that material is stored away from drainage pathways, and there should be an erosion management plan which should include sediment traps, filter fabric traps and grassed swales, and any excavated sand should not be stored for long periods on the site so that its washed back into the drainage system, and areas that are cleared to be paved or grassed as soon as possible. Portable toilets for workers should be properly monitored and maintained and construction spoils or construction material should be adequately stored on site and removed by an approved contractor. And Solid Waste Management; there maybe potential for pollution, and so therefore, there should be a Solid Waste Management

Plan for the development, they should construct adequate waste disposal bins and those should be elevated off the ground to prevent any infestation from pests; and they should allow for private contractors as well as the National Solid Waste Management Authority to ensure that waste is disposed of in an environmental friendly manner.

Some potential impacts from the operational phase of the development or this is when the houses are completed. These will include flooding on site, or downstream flooding. So, the developer has to ensure that the drains on site are appropriately sized to handle flows for at least up to a 50 year or a 100 year flood, as well as changes has to made to the Bower's Gully to ensure

that they manage the flows from the site or flows downstream.

The use of sediment traps to prevent any sediment runoff, gullies should be maintained and cleaned regularly, and any unpaved areas should also be kept vegetated.

Fugitive air dust may be caused from roads and un-vegetated areas so roads must be adequately maintained and cleaned, areas that are unpaved or un-vegetated should be vegetated so you should have a plan for vegetation and the establishment of speed limits to reduce the impact of fugitive dust.

Noise could come from people doing house repairs, or automobile repairs, maintained or expansion of their houses or also from increased traffic in the area. So of course, you have to adhere to the noise standards; and

if there are any planned activities that may have increased noise it should be communicated to the community.

In terms of water resources, the portable water that is being extracted maybe stressed under periods of droughts and so we encourage the persons in the area or your community to develop and encourage other means of water storage, things like rainwater harvesting.

Solid Waste Management in terms of improper disposal of solid waste may occur or delays in the collection of solid waste may occur. So, some of the mitigation measures suggested includes; minimization, promoting a use of minimisation and recycling, ensure that the community has a strong

citizens association that will use private garbage collection along with the National Solid Waste Management Agency to ensure that waste is collected as soon as possible.

There may be some increases in traffic on South Street or in Old Harbour due to the development because we are adding some 876 units and so we ask that people or the developer ensure that they work with the relevant agencies to ensure that the roads are upgraded and maintained to reduce the traffic levels.

Analysis of alternatives. So, one thing we do is that we considered the site and discuss other uses for the site. We know the site was used for agricultural lands and so we wonder if a housing development is the best thing for the site or there could be

any other usage for the site. According to the St. Catherine Development Order the site is actually zoned for residential development, and so that actually limits the amount of usage that could occur on the site; that means it cannot be used for industrial development on the site and so on. So, our alternatives have been limited to actually doing nothing on the site, leaving the site as it is, or creating housing development. With doing nothing we realized that the site will just remain as overgrown abandoned agricultural lands. This provides no benefits to the general public, no benefit to creating houses or increase employment. The property will also remain unsecured and abandoned and this will also encourage people to squat, it



encourages criminal and illegal activities. And it is a big fire hazard as the fire department has indicated, they had to respond to many bush fires in the area.

However, if a housing development is done, it will create 876 homes near Old Harbour and also near to Kingston. The construction phase will actually create employment for persons nearby or within the communities, as well as injection of significant capital into the economy for construction of the development through the process of materials and the purchase and rental of equipment and services.

In conclusion the Town and Country Planning Provision Development Order states that it is directly zoned for residential use and residential development.

Once the recommended mitigation measures are followed the project is not likely to have any significant environmental impacts.

The Whim Estate Housing Development is a suitable use for the site and will provide some 876 homes when completed. And this will probably house up to 3,500 persons. The project will also inject significant capital in the economy through the purchase of construction material, equipment and services.

Thank you. (Applause)

#### **QUESTION AND ANSWER SESSION**

The Chairman: Thank you, Mr. Coutou. For those who may have joined us a little later, my name is Florizel Allen, and I am here as facilitator of the discourse that is taking place. We have had our statements from NEPA, and we have had

our Environmental Assessment done by Environmental Solutions Limited.

We are moving into the section where we will have questions and feedbacks and discourse, discussions generally.

We have one microphone, so persons who will be addressing us will either speak loudly or if you prefer to come to the microphone, we will facilitate that.

I am going to ask you to proceed in a manner which will allow me to identify the persons who will speak, and then we will proceed. Remember NEPA is here, and we also have the Environmental Solutions Limited.

The questions will be fielded to the Environmental Solutions Limited.

I now open the floor for discussions, questions feedback.

The gentleman in the middle.

Mr. Mollison: Good evening my name is Winston Mollison..

The Chairman: Are we all hearing him?

Resident: No.

The Chairman: Please use the microphone.

Mr. Mollison: Good evening again my name is Winston Mollison, and I live in Old Harbour Village Two. I have a series of questions, but in the interest of those who want to ask other questions, I will ask them one at a time.

My first question has to do with the access route, the main access route to get to Whim's Estate. I hear Mr. Coutou mentioned that there are four possible entrances. Where will be the main entrance that is the number one point for us in New Harbour?

The Chairman: Thank you.

Mr. Coutou: Okay, so the main access for the proposed development will be South of the development, and you will access this through the road reserve from South Street, this actually cuts through New Harbour Village Two. The North Road, that cuts through New Harbour will actually be used as a secondary access to the new development. I will also ask Mr. Donaldson, Bruce Donaldson, the developer to discuss with you a little more about this access.

Mr. Donaldson: Good evening everyone my name is Bruce Donaldson, I am representing the developer, this evening. In answer to the first question as was outlined to you in the project brief, there will be - as was mentioned in the presentation, the development has two access routes as far as servicing the long term use or accesses to the

development, which is one way to New Harbour Village to the north section which is through the security gate there. And the other one is through the established road reserve that runs through the roundabout to the southern section of New Harbour Village Two and enters by the primary and secondary school reserve.

We will be doing all the development operations from this access route, so that no, none of the development materials, equipment, heavy equipment or anything of that nature will be accessing from or through these two access routes at any time.

You will have some amount of traffic and we have and will continue to be in consultation with the New Harbour Village Two Association with residents as we continue through the

project, we will be - obviously be doing a lot of consultations.

Mr. Mollison: Mr. Donaldson, may I put the question to you another way. If I were to buy house in the Whim Proposed Development, where would I drive or walk to get to that house? That is exactly what I want to find out. Where am I going to go through, am I going to travel on the toll road, go through Village Four, Village Two or wherever; I want to know exactly where I will walk or where I will drive?

Mr. Donaldson: Yes, I was outlining. The primary access will be through the southern road reserve, but the authorities from all of these developments were put in place from Gore Development got the approval for New Harbour Village Two, and they required two accesses for this area. One was this north

access, and as you know from the beginning of the development there has always been a gate to this block of land. Just to give you a little background. I basically, my involvement in this is that I am the land owner, I represent the land owner of Old Harbour Estate Limited. So, our participation in this, just as was given to Gore is really the land side that is our investment in it.

I have also been a member working with the Old Harbour Development area committees and SDC for many years, and we have been operating the agricultural operative here for many years. So, I am very familiar with the area, and I have been trying, working very hard for the overall Development in the area. So, it is not a matter that we just come in along and have no involvement or ongoing involvement



in seeing the area being developed in a positive and as sustainable manner going forward as possible. We are not just building and leaving, I will be building and staying because we have other developments in the area.

So as I said these accesses were placed there from the previous development and as you all know, the gates were there, it was placed in the sale agreements, it was given in literature, it was put in videos, anybody who purchase in the New Harbour Village Two Development and these accesses are a requirement of the authorities. So, whether it is us doing it or Gore had continued - Gore Development had continued with the Development going towards the area, this would have been part of that requirement.

The Chairman: Is it a follow-up?

Mr. Mollison: Yes.

The Chairman: Do your follow-up and then I take someone else.

Mr. Mollison: Mr. Donaldson, I am now forced to assert the facts. Years ago, the land the development will be on was farm lands. Subsequently when the land was sold by you, for the Development Company to Gore, there were some provisions put in place so as to access to the farm. Correct so far, which is through the main entrance now being used by New Harbour Village Two. Now those are contained in the title and in the document, nobody here who lives in New Harbour Village Two was not aware of those, what I call contingency plans being put in place ahead of time, in other words to facilitate future development. Now,

after many persons here have invested their money in this, they have now realized that they have brought into a gated community only to find out by virtue of what is already in the law by containing the title and the document that you have on page 14, which is the splinter title to say that the person are now going to come through the other village to access; 875 houses at least 3,000 more persons coming through. Now, you will have to tell us how you are going to stop those persons who are going to be driving through New Harbour Village Two, from splintering into New Harbour Village Two that is one.

Are you proposing to put an external gate, or internal gate so that persons who are going to go towards Whim Estate will no longer divert into New Harbour Village two, that is the main

area of concern for us in New Harbour Village Two?

Mr. Donaldson: Yes, and as I said we have to, in dealing with this, we are going to continue to have ongoing consultation with New Harbour Village Two. However, as I said, these are requirements that were put in place from Gore Development had these things and placed these plans in application to the authorities. It is a requirement of this and this we - the Development is fully adhering to all of the zoning requirements, the development requirements of the area. So it is not - I cannot understand why having had these consultations over the years, why these things were clearly pointed out, why the full reserves are laid, the writs that they are, that obviously are for increased traffic flow for the future

which is why these reserves were put in place. And this all of a sudden have become a major issue. And I am therefore trying to say that it is not my intension for it to be an issue that cannot be resolved. We are going to be working as closely as possible with the members of the association to mitigate, you know, any major impact to the community. It is not a matter that we are just going to bulldoze our way into or anything like this, that is not how we operate, that is not our intension, in the case like this here.

We are going to be completely monitored by authorities, we are going to clearly be adhering to all the development requirements, and that is how we will be proceeding. And clearly it is in our best interest as the developer in this area to ensure

that the project we are doing is going to be adding and enhancing the value, and the safety and the economic development of the area.

The Chairman: Any more question, that young lady.

Ms. Gooden: Good night, I am a resident of New Harbour Village Two. My question is a bit similar to Mr. Mollison's last question because my main concern is safety, right?

Now I bought into a gated community and I pay a maintenance fee monthly, to feel safe, right, now visitors are screened at the gate, right? Now with your access through the main gate, I am not sure how screening will happen, I am not sure how as he said it will control just the main road and not allow persons into the community; because I am afraid, not sure if you can answer?

Mr. Donaldson: In that regard, can I say that I watched the Development of New Harbour Village Two over the years that took place, and I am sure that when the first section up there were being built, because I saw the movement of the perimeter fencing which then became a wall and that sort of thing. Just as in the case of Gore, there will be throughout the entire course of development security provisions adequately put in place to ensure that those things are mitigated against.

Residents: But after?

Mr. Donaldson: But that is what I am saying, in the same way that residents are going to be secured here, the same - it is in the same manner the residents here are going to be secured. It is going to be a gated community the same way.

Ms Gooden: How, when there is only one gate?

Mr. Donaldson: No, no as I said this will be the primary access. This has to be an access for regulatory authority requirements it has always been that way. But as far as the primary access goes, it is through this road.

Ms. Gooden: You will provide security?

Mr. Donaldson: Yes.

Ms Gooden: You will provide security for the main gate?

Mr. Donaldson: During the course of the development yes, we will.

Ms Gooden: After.

Mr. Donaldson: No, the developer - in the same way that this association here manages and operates the dues that are collected for their association, it is the same way that we will be working to create the association for



Whim Estates that also will be working in conjunction with New Harbour Village Two to see how best it will go long term. But as I say, as the developer it is in our own best interest to ensure the safety of everybody there, the security of everybody there. Nobody is going to buy into somewhere that you don't feel there is long term security measures that will be put in place.

The Chairman: Okay, I just want to confirm that her name is Stacy-Ann Gooden, right? Please remember when you come to ask the question, please indicate your name and what - who you represent. We will have the next question.

Ms. Nembhard: Sandra Nembhard, Resident of Old Harbour Bay, Shelter Manager, ODPEM. Here is where we host our shelter for the entire South Old Harbour Bay. Now

we have New Harbour One, Two and Three and now we are going to have another development. So, it is going to be Four. This little tiny area cannot contain so many persons in case of an emergency.

Last year we had some mishap of a tsunami warning, and the sea in Old Harbour Bay keep rising when there is a disaster the sea rises, for those who are new, and the water will come in ashore. However, for persons to get access out of Old Harbour Bay, the Kelly Pen area is one of our main access roads into Old Harbour. New Harbour the Whim Estate, well, I don't know if they are going to put a wall up like in New Harbour Two, that wall is going to be there too? So, the access route will no longer be for the Old Harbour Bay residents to leave. Kelly Pen where you are talking about

the South, into Old Harbour Bay out at Kelly Pen you know where the farms are right behind Mr. Williams' farm. So that access route is one of our main access routes to lead us into Old Harbour in case you have to run, we have the Old Harbour Main Road, we have Kelly Pen, we have signs that the Government of Jamaica place in and around the area to say this is one of our main access routes. So, when we get to behind Whim, because we go through Whim now, New Harbour block us out without any consultation, we did not have any consultation. People were not consulted. Mr Donaldson is my good friend, and I want us to consult, I want us to look into the matter because we are living in the Bay and we got to get out, you are up here; but you are not so safe too. So, the access route, the availability to

get out the way, very important part of the development, take that into consideration.

The Bower's Gully, next thing, when we had Matthew, the Terminal area was devastated, all the water from New Harbour Four, that is the development going down by Hi-Pro, so that gully that they drill out, but in drilling out the gully I don't know technology, the word for it, they drill it out. But you know what they did, they drill it to take the water out of Four, Two and all of that, but they don't drill it directly into the sea. So, the water spread to Terminal and my God, the people suffer in Terminal.

I am just saying, whenever this development is going to be done and anybody else, please take into consideration the water that comes

from up here, needs to run off into the sea. And if you are doing the houses jam, jam, jam, and not doing the gullies and the drains, there is going to be trouble.

What you call the Free Town access, you mentioned Free Town access there is bridge there that is called 'Bun Down Bridge' you have to do your research, 'Bun Down Bridge' is the bridge that looks like Flat Bridge, that is one of the bridges that was built way back; there are some little pieces that are there - anybody know? We are talking about how do you get from Old Harbour Bay from Free Town. Let the developer answer my question because I know what I am talking about. You know Free Town? Free Town, he mentioned Free Town, he mentioned Free Town, one of the bridges into Old Harbour Bay comes through Free

Town into the River you got to cross over a bridge, if you don't know anything you don't talk about it, I know, so you talk 'Bun Down Bridge' take that into consideration to come down into Old Harbour Bay. Because we are talking about disaster.

So, these are my concerns as it relates to disaster because it is real, and it will affect us.

The Chairman: We will have a comment. Please remember everyone will get a chance to voice their concerns and to ask their questions. So, we are going to have the response and then we will have the questions.

Mr. Donaldson: I am going to ask our Civil Engineer, Stephan Rampair from Premier Land and Water Development, to speak to the issue of the gully and the flood mitigation measures.

The Engineer: Good evening everyone. You can hear me in the back.

Residents: Yes.

The Engineer: Okay, with regards to flooding, our responsibility is to ensure that the development itself does not adversely affect, in a new way, anything, any downstream activities.

Now, what I would say is that the Bower's Gully area is a very, very large catchment incorporating over ten thousand acres. I think some of the issues we are taking about are issues that exist all the time. In other words, once there is flooding - with or without - I would say with or without Gore, with or without Mr. Donaldson, there is a need to address a storm situation for the south and that is more of a national issue that needs to be done on a national level,

and it certainly would not be possible for any one developer to address that situation globally.

Mr. Donaldson: In response to Ms Nembhard's comments regarding emergency access or escape routes with regards to the people of Old Harbour Bay along the Kelly Pen road. Clearly, during disaster events of that type, ODPEM will, that is under the law that these mitigation measures, is to allow accesses where in extreme events through prescribed areas, this must be in place.

So, these are not events that will be happening on a daily basis, and if they are happening everybody in the area will be aware of it. And of course, that will require additional police presence and additional regulatory authority presence to ensure that the safety of the



residents in Old Harbour Bay is taken care of in whatever manner is needed. Again, as the developer, we will be informing the citizen of the association as we hand over units that of all of these measures are requirements coming out of any community, whether it is ours, next door or whatever, OPDEM puts in place whether now or in the future, we are clearly going to adhere to their guidelines.

Mr. Mollison: Whilst we appear to be belabouring the point on access, there are some things which I want to make sure that everybody here is aware of.

For example, after the 876 houses are built and delivered, what about the development of the economic zone as it relates to the Port Esquivel Development which is going to use

reserve roads, which is the road south heading towards Old Harbour Bay which is across from New Harbour Village Three, which has been reserved from 1970 by the Government of Jamaica which was to facilitate Highway 2000, that road which should have been behind the school now reserve road number eight, which would have been right across from New Harbour Village Three. Now that is also a part of the proposed development with the expansion of the Port Esquivel Zone, and also any farming that is going to be part of Whim's Development as well.

So, the issue of access is of fundamental importance to us in New Harbour Village Two, but not only that, we will be getting a double strike. You will be facilitating through the front, which is on South Street end, and then the Economic Zone

Development down by from right across from New Harbour Village Three, or where Gore has its site office.

Secondly, with all of that development and access, no mention is yet made, we have not yet touched the point of the school and the proposed development which was abandoned by Gore development, and we don't reach to that stage yet. All of these things are very important and relevant to us in New Harbour Village Two and the wider citizens of Old Harbour. We can't ignore that but for now, my primary concern is the primary access. Even if you do a tsunami drill, when another three thousand (3,000) people is going to have to come through New Harbour Village Two gate that is of a major concern. It is time for you now to make serious consideration to choose an alternate

route to get to that housing development other than New Harbour Village Two gate, although in principle, you have put measures in place for that already that was in place from 2010, before the very first unit was handed out. I have copy of the document and I have seen the splinter title at the Titles Office. So, I know what I am talking about.

(Applause)

Mr. Donaldson: I just trying to clearly understand what you are saying. Are you saying that the road reserve, the southern road reserve number two, is on the title as a road reserve for access to this area or it is not?

Mr. Mollison: No, no the reserve is there, it has been there from it was established in 1970, and that is part of the road that is behind the school, where the

school is located now or part of where the school - which is in the title.

(Showing title to Mr. Donaldson and team)

So, the reserve road which is the road that has been there from 1970, which is also across from Village Three right? So, I was asking you, I was asking you if it is on that consideration that you use that section as your primary access?

(Consulting)

That is the construction phase.

Mr. Coutou: No, this is the construction. This is the construction phase which would come from this direction (Indicating). This is the primary access.

Mr. Mollison: So, where the residents would come through?

Mr. Engineer: This road. (Indicating)

Mr. Mollison: Okay, so if they are going to come to this road, what is going to deter them from splintering into village two further? You are going to put a wall here now? It is not contained in no document that a wall is going to be there, you know. We don't see it nowhere at all.

Mr. Coutou: Alright, so the answer to the question is that, this blue line is the primary road for the access to the development when the development is in operation that is for the residents of the development. Okay.

Mr. Donaldson has indicated that he will ensure there is a wall and ensure that the residents are not going to the Whim Estates would not go into New Harbour Village Two.

Mr. Donaldson: So clearly, what is going to happen is that this area south of the road is known as phase 7 - 6 and 7, so we are going to have consultation with the members of 6 and 7 in particular to establish the access to their community from that road. Because New Harbour Village Two, from the north to the - from this section to here would retain the access from the top. But to have it as a secondary route, as I say, this long term would have to have their own gate.

Ms. Mollison: My name is Deloris Mollison and I am the Chairperson for the New Harbour Citizen Association. And I am wondering, sir, if I am hearing you correctly, Mr. Donaldson, are you saying you are going to have communication with persons from phase 6 and 7? Because we are one community... (Applause) ...and part of the concern

we have is that, that is going to create a separation with Village - phases one, two, three, four, and five from six and seven. So, I am not sure if I understand what you are saying about the whole conversation that you are going to have for that section right there?

And I want to also add, and I am going back to the main entrance, New Harbour Village Two main entrance. I want to be clear of what you are saying. Are you saying that your main access will not be through New Harbour Village Two main gate at present? It will be at the southern end you are saying, sir?

Mr. Donaldson: Yes, but the authorities require us to retain - yes, the southern access will be the main access to Whim Development. However, the authority requires that we must and within law,



must retain access through new - at the top road in red of New Harbour Village Two.

Ms. Mollison: For current main entrance you are saying?

Mr. Donaldson: Yes, it is a requirement.

Ms. Mollison: Okay. So, it is contingency for.

Mr. Coutou: Alright, so, I think what is happening here is that, Mr. Donaldson has indicated that the two access roads are road reserves for future developments. They were established for the future development and that is why they have the wider reserves. For the south access he will create a wall to ensure the safety of the Community of New Harbour Village Two, so that persons travelling along the road will not access your community. He will also work with you to establish this wall, and to ensure

that all security provisions are provided during construction and in operational phase.

Ms. Gooden: My concern is that - I live around the back phase 6 and 7, so I don't want to be cut off from the front of the scheme, so that is going to be my concern?

Mr. Donaldson: As I said, in response to that as I said this is a provision that was put in place from before we started this. Whether it was Gore Development or any other developer who had continue the development of this annex to New Harbour Village Two, that was the requirement which is why two road accesses were put in place. It was not put in place because New Harbour Village Two require the second road access. New Harbour Village Two did not require the second road access,

it was for additional development of the lands between New Harbour Village Two and the Bower's cut off point of the housing development in that area under the Highway 2000 zoning. So that is why that southern road was not developed, it is a government main road reserve for service, the additional development of that area going west of New Harbour Village.

The Chairman: Are there any other questions, concerns?

The Engineer: In terms of future development, we spoke about Esquivel Development and certainly along the Government main road it is expected that Esquivel Development will be able to access the - where there is eventual development, of the school, a plan at the southern end of the development, and the point being that right now,

we are talking about the question of access of the north side from the Whim Estate through New Harbour Village. But when that school is built, it will actually be the other way, to which residents from New Harbour Village accessing the school through the Whim Estate. So, bear in mind that once the development of Esquivel takes place, once jobs are created, once work, you know, starts to develop on the southern section of the Old Harbour area, the dynamics of the traffic will actually reverse to this one point. So, the other point is, clearly, there needs to be advance planning in the development, and you know, that is why the road reserves are there to ensure continued development, continued orderly development by developers.

The Chairman: Any more questions?

Mr. Weir: Good evening, everyone my name is Lynton Weir, I am the principal on this institution. When I heard reference to school my ears went up. Because one of the concerns that we have been having over the years is that we have seen quite a number of housing solutions in this area, and all the housing solutions that we have been seeing, we have not seen anything that relates to school. (Applause)

Where we are now, Old Harbour High School cannot carry the entire community; and what is happening over the years is we continue to have these housing solutions expecting that this one institution will carry all the children in the community.

Separate and apart from that, we have seen all the different developers come in and even if they did not

assign an area to have a school, they have not come in to partner with us to say to us, tell you what, we have not designated an area for school, but we are going to give you a block of classrooms to take in the overflow.

(Applause)

Another point I want to say here, I did not hear you say whether it is going to be a high school that you are going to be building or you are going to be building an early childhood school. Because I don't think one school will be able to do it. Because if you are thinking of a high school, then what happen to the kids, because before they reach high school, they would have to enter early childhood, which means that they are going to need that as well.

Separate and apart from that too, here is another situation. I have been in the traffic one and a half hours coming down, because this meeting was scheduled for 6 o'clock, and I was on time because they are doing some work. The question here is, is there any plans for the opening in Sharper Lane for us to have - so if you are coming from Spanish Town and you open that area in Sharper Road; what happen when they are going into the bypass, they close it off. If you are coming from Spanish Town then there is no need for you to come into Old Harbour if you are opening up the Sharper Road because that is going to take you right through New Harbour Village one, two, three... (Applause) that is something that I would love for you to look at. Because building housing solution is fine, but you must provide

the citizens with the amenities so that they can have comfortable lives.

Thank you. (Applause)

Mr. Donaldson: Yes, I too being an ongoing member of this community, I am working very hard to try and get the authorities to assist us in developing this location which is reserved from when Gore Development put it on, and the primary and secondary school. So, this lot in the sales arrangement was proposed as a reserve to develop a school that will service primary and secondary demands for the new school areas.

We didn't discuss the type and the whole idea is that it would start to move students from the areas from here and here to this location instead of along the - as much through the high school area.



So this is - I think about a fifteen acre parcel, but there are areas along the Lower Bower's area which would be very good to - which I will be working with the developers, when I say that, the school and also the area to try and develop it into additional playing fields and things like these. Because, all the other things that is lacking in a lot of schools is enough areas for playing fields and sports. That side of things and I think there are lot of opportunities along this area which is able to expand the actual class room facility in one area, and have very nearby sports facilities, and also instead of having a sports facility which is just one playing field which is over used, and even with the best intension and all of that, we need to have multiple

fields of business as they do in more rural areas in the country.

Mr. Mollison: Mr. Donaldson, pursuant to your deed of easement into the Bower's, on the 27<sup>th</sup> - well, the further endorsement was on the 27<sup>th</sup> of July 2010, and further endorsed on the 17<sup>th</sup> of May 2017, in regard to the sewer. Now, the document says and for the purpose of persons attending here, I will read paragraph two:

**To survey, construct, lay, and after words at all times, to relay and repair maintain, inspect, renew, replace, remove or render, useable or faults not exceeding one hundred millimetres, nominal diameters together with markers and other works and ancillary apparatus all new property of the..**

In short what I am saying, and it is says, you are going to ensure that New Harbour Village Four is protected and that sewer system goes to the system at New Harbour Village Two. What is going to transpire of the existing structure in New Harbour Village Two, as it relates to sewer?

And I give you the background, right now with the addition of New Harbour Village Four, sewer system being connected to our sewer system, if you were to drive down there now you would see the damage to the road and at times in fact a resident is here whose house has been flooded out at least twice. And I don't think the St Catherine Health Department, nor the relevant agencies are doing enough to protect the citizens. It is time for us as residents to arm ourselves to the teeth by virtue of the law and

through the courts to ensure that the necessary measures are put in place to protect ourselves and our investments.

I see the document here and it says, to the sewer station. Is it such that when you realign the Bower's Gully and make modification to the sewer system it is going to going to disturb that which exist?

Mr. Coutou: Alright, just to give further background, the sewer line that you are speaking about comes from New Harbour Village Four, it runs under the Highway, under the bridge of Bower's Gully and then takes a right on this area. But because that area is left as a reserve because there is a sewer line running there as well as some electrical wires, high voltage electrical wiring, so that area has

been left as a reserve and this goes across to Old Harbour Village Two.

The realignment of Bower's Gully is from south of the Highway and so it will not interface with that sewer line.

Mr. Mollison: What I am concerned about is what is contained in this document. If in the deed of easement there is going to be some adjustments, so I am saying that...

The Engineer: Just to be clear, any easement is just a granting for the line to be installed, Mr. Donaldson has nothing to do with installation, the ongoing maintenance of that line. Any question relating to that would really have to be addressed by the National Water Commission.

Mr. Mollison: Sir, is it not reasonable for me to say if they are going to adjust, fix, realign or widen that which exist?

The Engineer: Yes, and that question was answered that we are not impacting that line and easement in the above.

Mr. Coutou: So, the housing development, the area where the sewer runs will be left untouched. It will be left as an easement, because the sewer line is there, and we are not the owners for the sewer line and the maintenance to that sewer line. So, there will be no development along the easement for the sewer line. The development will not be impacting the sewer line in any way that they will have to adjust or interfere with that sewer line. Okay, what the agreement allows is the easement for access to that sewer line by the owners of the sewer line. The sewer line is installed by Gore and will be handed over to NWC. Does that answer your question?

Mr. Weir: Just a follow-up question to the question I asked before. I am not going to belabour the point any at all. But you are living in an area that is identified for school, we are seeing in the past where there was an area that was identified for school. The question I want to ask, that area that is identified for school is it that you are going to be taking the responsibility to construct the school or is it that you are going to give the land to the government to construct the school? Because if it is the latter, we are going to have some challenges. Because from where I sit, it is going to be extremely difficult for the Government. So, I want to know from the developers is it that you are going to be constructing the school, or you are

going to donate the land to the Ministry of Education to construct?

The Engineer: In the approval process, the developer is required to allocate or leave land for the Government to develop. The development of a school, a high school as you know, a high school cost about one billion dollars to construct, and possible about five hundred million for a primary school. That type of investment should and is a part of a national agenda, and we are in no way denying that there is need in the area for an educational institution.

The Chairman: Okay we will get a question from Ms Nembhard.

Ms. Nembhard: Yes, sir I am not against this development, it is a good development and especially when you mention about water sir, it is a very excellent



presentation, Mr. Donaldson, but I just hope that for this development, it comes from experience. Just that this development with NEPA and other persons we can make them they pay for the schools. Just try to understand, if you as developer can push for this at this time, it would be beneficial. The next thing you mentioned about clinic, thousands of persons coming in and there is no clinic arrangement except the one in Old Harbour. So again, if we all, not Mr. Donaldson alone, all of us in here make sensible representation, then we can get these things to go on.

The Engineer: I support the educational institution; I was simple saying that this development is not a part of the construction. But I can tell you that with other responsibilities that Mr.

Donaldson has he has been promoting and looking people to come and help build that school for our community not necessary as part of this Development. But in his other roles, definitely Mr. Donaldson has been advocating for that school with much vigour.

The Chairman: Is there any other question, is there any other concern? Am I to presume that we have heard all your concerns and ask all the questions? Are there any other questions?

Mr. Mollison: We definitely have to meet outside of this, we have to have another meeting. It does not make sense we ask any more. When are you going to facilitate another consultative meeting so as to get the other questions cleared up and any

concerned heard today addressed and going forward?

The Chairman: The concern expressed is whether there will be another consultative meeting to address any other follow-up meeting that they may have?

Okay, to facilitate any further consultation Mr. Coutou has indicated that you may write to NEPA or to the developer or to Environmental Solutions to facilitate such.

So, if you have heard all the concerns for tonight, then I would like to thank ESL and NEPA; and I would like to thank in particular citizens especially New Harbour who have come out to express their concerns and their questions. They have been duly noted, NEPA has taken notes, and if there is to be any follow-up you will be advised.

Thank you very much for coming out and sharing with us tonight.

Before you leave there will be some refreshment serve at the back.

Thank you very much for coming and sharing with us.

**Adjournment taken at 8:24 p.m.**