

TAPE BEGINS

RAMMELAERE: Sorry. Mr name is Mark Rammelaere. I'm the director of the application management division in the National Environmental Planning Agency. I will introduce to you here the people who that have actually been selected to execute the EIA. The company is EMC² [um..] stands for Environmental Management Consultants Caribbean. Excuse me. The main resource persons are Dr. Burrowes, Ravidya Burrowes, and Dr. Boyd Dent. Dr. Burrowes will actually give you an introduction in terms of the Terms of Reference..... in relation to the Terms of Reference. Dr. Dent will give you a more detailed assessment of what the scope of the hydro-geological risks assessment will entail. I just would like to highlight the skills of these persons. I just want to just highlight what the skills that we have here tonight in front of us. Dr. Burrowes has a Ph.D in geology. She has worked for more than 30 years in the field of conducting environmental impact assessments and in the area of watershed management. She has worked extensively in Jamaica, Trinidad, St. Kitts, Antigua, Haiti and Cayman. Dr. Dent has actually been working - he is an engineer and geologist, specializing in hydrogeology. He's from Australia. He asked me to mention his funny accent and asked me to apologize for it. I don't think I need to apologize for my funny accent. I just would like highlight that he has been working since 1995 in the area of the impact of cemeteries on the ...on basically the water resources...in other words the hydro-geological impact of cemeteries. He himself has been extensively working in Australia but also in Germany. He has been giving consultations to cemetery developments in the States, Canada and many others. I will cut my presentation here short because it will be a long evening. I thank you again and I thank you for coming to this meeting. Bye.

MODERATOR: We thank you for that introduction of our team and at this moment I would like us to welcome Dr. Burrowes, and hear from him his presentation as to his function in studying this development and he will be able to...he is more technical on the areas. It's HER, her I was - right.....so Dr. Burrowes at this moment we will hear from her to see and hear the process as we go on.

BURROWES: Thank you. Good evening everybody. I'd like to thank you all for coming. My presentation this evening, I will try to make it brief. Essentially what I want to do is present to you the Terms of Reference for the Environmental Impact Assessment. For those of you who are wondering - the purpose of this meeting is to advise the community that the impact study is going on and what the schedule is for completion, to introduce the team (which has happened a few minutes ago), and really to provide you an opportunity to have some input into the EIA at the very start so that in about six weeks we will be coming back to you to report our findings and to report on the concerns you raise tonight. For those who do not know what an environmental study is, NEPA's contract to *emc*² is to conduct what is called an Environmental Impact Assessment. We are going to ask people to hold questions until the end[voice from audience - unintelligible]

BURROWES: Can I just interrupt you....there will be an opportunity for questions at the end.....

MODERATOR (Dr. Duncan's voice in the background...words not clear): Wait. Dr. Duncan, Dr. Duncan...we have an agenda. I am aware of what you are saying. No. No listen Dr. Duncan, you are talking about the process.....no, all right, hold on. Dr. Duncan, Dr. Duncan, Dr. Duncan, this is not the appropriate time for that.Wait, but wait. Wait. Wait. Dr. Duncan, Dr. Duncan you are a leader. Just hold a minute. OK. OK. So what you are saying here Dr. Duncan? Can you use the mike please. Can you use the mike. Just...

DUNCAN: The only opportunity after today that the citizens of 32 communities affected by the possibility of a cemetery which is half a mile from their main water supply is to speak to the Terms of Reference, and to influence the outcome is today and then in March when you have finished your work. Now, the representatives that should be here today are not here because the notice was inadequate to mobilize the

MODERATOR: Hold on, hold on, hold on....no

DUNCAN: So therefore...no hold on....therefore since you are here the few people who are here may want....

MODERATOR: ...information. I know the information....

DUNCAN: No...no...

MODERATOR: Go ahead. Go ahead.

DUNCAN: Why are you anticipating.....

MODERATOR: I'm listening. Go ahead.

DUNCAN: You don't understand the meaning of participation.....

MODERATOR: Dr. Duncan I said go ahead. We are waiting on you.

DUNCAN: OK. So I said to you, we are going to suggest to you, since we checked out the Terms of Reference, the agreement of the contract in relation to sensitizing the **thirty-two communities** as to what face them that you schedule another date for the first meeting to do this explanation and only treat today as a preliminary discussion among the few people who are here so that we can help you to get as many people as possible to come to the first meeting.

MODERATOR: I think that's a fair enough...I think that's fair...so no problem. No problem. But in the meantime I take your point Dr. Duncan and I know you mean well with that one. All right.

DUNCAN: So the agreement, let the record show that today's meeting is only a preliminary meeting, Part A of the first meeting, as indicated in the contractual arrangement between emc² and NEPA. That you now have a responsibility, all of us, to go and **mobilize the thirty-two communities** likely to be affected by the possibility of the cemetery for the first meeting.

BURROWES: Thank you sir. We'll take that under advisement

DUNCAN: No, no...not under advisement - by agreement.

BURROWES: We need to continue.....

DUNCAN: No, no - we don't need to continue, if we do not agree on that there is no more meeting. If we do not agree the meeting is over. **[clapping from participants]** We will sit with you.....

BURROWES: No. You are very wrong in your assumption that this is the only opportunity. And if you will allow me to proceed, I will present the schedule and explain in great detail the opportunities.....

DUNCAN: The document states, I do not want you to go ahead and assume that we had a meeting....

BURROWES: I'm going to have to ask you....

DUNCAN: No you don't understand what I'm saying ma'am....

MODERATOR: Wait. Dr. Duncan (*Duncan speaking in background 'document states clearly.'*) Dr. Duncan.

DUNCAN:document states clearly - that there have to be two public consultations.

MODERATOR: Dr. Duncan

DUNCAN: Two only

MODERATOR: Doctor, we are aware of what you are saying. But at this point, Doctor, we are saying that with the consultant, their agreement for today - that is what we're here.

DUNCAN: No. No. No. No. No. You are here to tick off. To tick it off. We are here for participation and consultation. (*Moderator trying to intervene 'nuh, nuh'*). No. I know how these things working. **You are here to tick off your work plan, "We met with the citizens of the area affected by the thing"**. I am saying to you, this meeting is not a representative meeting of the communities, the 32 (*Moderator trying to intervene*) communities affected by the possibility and therefore we will, we will sit only with you.

MODERATOR: No, but Dr. Duncan, if we are here and dealing with this. The NEPA representative has made his presentation. Dr. Burrowes was in her presentation. It is just for you to let us minute that. We can deal with that later on.

DUNCAN: No. No we can't. No. No. No. You will...**If we allow you to do that you can then go back to NEPA, in Kingston and say "we had our meeting" and we are saying, this is not a meeting!** This is a preliminary discussion to plan for the next meeting. That's all this can be. (**Voices not on mike...not clear what is being said**). There is no problem that we can set a proper date to **mobilize** the citizens ...

MODERATOR: Yeh. Yeh. Wait. Wait. Gentlemen. Gentlemen. Dr. Duncan. Ah...yes. Just one point. You are saying that we are just for one meeting. Two meetings. But we are saying, an EIA, the meeting is generally at the end of the EIA.

DUNCAN: (**Loud**) No. (**Loud voices from floor**)

MODERATOR: No. Look here. No. No. (**Voices from floor**) No. Wait. Wait. We are not here to quarrel you know. We can reason this thing out. No. We (are ?) to reason it out.

DUNCAN: No. No. I agree with you. We are not here to quarrel.

MODERATOR: We are not here to quarrel.

DUNCAN: But. But. But we have to establish very clearly (*Moderator "uh huh"*) what are the rules of engagement. **These communities have been shafted.** The reason, you know, that the government is going to pay - **the taxpayers of Jamaica are now going to pay 3.8 million dollars for the mistake of NEPA.**

MODERATOR: No. No, Doctor. We are not here to deal with the political aspect of it. Let us just deal with...Wait. Wait. (**heckling**) Wait. That is why....Wait. Wait. Yeh. I know. Let us just....let us just keep it at a level. (**More heckling**).

DUNCAN: Hold on. Project Implementation Schedule. Hold on a second, hold on now. Why they consult. Project Implementation Schedule: Week One, 2nd January - sign contract; 8th January - other work - schedule of bore hole contractor and backhoe renters; 22nd January - preparation of project description; 29th January - field work and first public meeting Friday 2nd February - water and soil sampling and testing. The only other public meeting as agreed to under the contract is the 2nd of April or three weeks after the EIA is available. That's the draft report. **The original request was for three meetings.** The decision was only to have two and this is the only one which will be the consultation with the public prior to the final draft report.

MODERATOR: um...but....

DUNCAN: Therefore this meeting is not a representative meeting of the 32 communities. Since you are here, I am proposing that we can have a little committee meeting which can decide: 1. When is the date for the first meeting? 'Cause this is not the first meeting...and then we will help you to mobilize the 32 communities to come and listen to the doctors and the scientists and everybody, because the people who are going to be affected by the scheduled water supply and the cemetery are not here. They were told, they saw it in the Gleaner, a few of us saw it in the Gleaner on Thursday or Wednesday, and a few notices were put up about two days ago. **The people in this community are very cynical because Mr. Delapenha did that to them already. And the government did that to them already. So they are not going to make the same mistake again.** So unless we can agree that this is NOT the meeting there shall be no meeting. (**Clapping**).

MODERATOR: Yes. Dr. Duncan, I take your point and I think the NEPA representative there, will be responding to your request as discussed a while ago.

RAMMELAERE: Yes. Good evening again....I'm willing to concede at first to have another meeting on this. I have no problem with that. I also would like to highlight, to actually point out, to impress on it, that at any time we are open to any sort of information and any direction that you may come up within the course of between now and the finishing of the EIA. We will... and we will look at any sort of comments that may come from the community as regards the Terms of Reference...so we really want to point out that the EIA is not completed and the opportunities to comment actually on the approach and the methodologies can be made at any time.

MODERATOR: So Dr. Duncan, we take that we can meet and...

DUNCAN: Who is recording the (*Moderator: 'It is being recorded right now'*) ...and the decision is...What is the decision?

MODERATOR: Just a minute...

RAMMELAERE: Well the decision is that we will keep another meeting.

DUNCAN: Not 'another'. The first meeting as outlined in the schedule of activities. This is a preliminary meeting.

RAMMELAERE: At this point, I cannot tell you again what the first meeting (*Duncan in background*) because you are actually... my question to you is, "What do you consider adequate notice?" because this meeting was advertised (**heckling**), it was advertised, it was the newspaper advertised...

DUNCAN: Which day? When was it advertised?

RAMMELAERE: Thursday. OK.

DUNCAN: No. Mr. Rammelaere. Really. Really. Any meeting of even the Burial Scheme Society, you have to give it a week's notice. And I say burial scheme advisedly .since we deal with cemetery.

RAMMELAERE: Well, the next meeting, the next meeting will be... we've given you a notice one week. Will that be enough?

DUNCAN: Yes. Yes. Yes. The first meeting.

RAMMELAERE: The first meeting will be held, and I will agree, we agree, we will publish it one week ahead of the.....

DUNCAN: No. You won't be able to publish it one week ahead but we will take it from you. You can still publish it, but we will take the notice from you now and you can have it in one week if it is convenient. What I'm

saying...we're not insisting you know, that it must be published in the paper although it is suggested. But having it published is...it is too late for us to get the representatives from the communities **So in one week's time I believe that the PDC will be able to assist everybody, all the interested parties to bring together representatives of the 32 communities.** **(Responding to someone in the audience)** No. No. He understands the point. No. What we are conceding is that you don't have to put a new ad in the paper today. Because you can't. Because it is next week. It is one week from now. You can't put it in the paper today. But this is notice. These are some of the people who are activists, citizen activists who look in the paper from day to day.

RAMMELAERE: So we agree on...to wait...

DUNCAN: So let's say, for the Western Mirror, for the next issue. That is the paper that most people read here. But what date would you suggest?

RAMMELAERE: What date would the PDC suggest?

DUNCAN: They say one week, because they have a deadline to meet. Next week Friday? Same time? Is that possible?

RAMMELAERE: I think that's possible.

DUNCAN: Yes. Because I'm sure the citizen's would mobilize for representatives from each community

RAMMELAERE: All right. Yeh.

MODERATOR: All right. Dr. Duncan we are saying that the notices are now. Is that OK with you?

DUNCAN: Yes. But we are saying put a notice in the Mirror.

MODERATOR: That will be like for Wednesday....and that will cover us.

DUNCAN: That will cover us.

MODERATOR: That will cover everything. We are saying that in the meantime now

DUNCAN: One week the notice...

MODERATOR:we will have our little discussion as we are here now....

DUNCAN: But right now we want you to sensitize us as to what this is so that we can go and explain to people...that they must come because this document is long....

MODERATOR: Very long.

DUNCAN: And what you are going to describe there is not easy ...

MODERATOR: ..to comprehend. To comprehend.....

DUNCAN:just in your presentation.....

MODERATOR: To comprehend. All right. Let's just allow Dr. Burrowes to....

DUNCAN:that's all right. That is great. Just as long as we understand it. We are fine. Just so long as we understand it. I'd love to understand it. That's fine.

MODERATOR: Okay. Thank you very much. All right Dr. Duncan. So thank you very much sir. So be it have Dr. Burrowes present on her.....okay. No problem.

BURROWES: If there are no further comments....if there are ...Please refrain from discussing...If there are any further comments we'll take them at the end of the presentation. (**Voice heard**) No. Excuse me sir (**more comments from floor - no microphone**)

MODERATOR: (**Voices from the audience throughout. May pauses.**). All right. All right. Dr. Duncan. Dr. Duncan, I know, know know. Dr. Duncan, Dr. Duncan you're....Dr. Duncan, I know, but you're adding to it. Dr. Duncan, we are speaking with civility as well. Dr. Duncan, Dr. Duncan that is not...(clapping). Dr. Duncan, I do not expect that Dr. Duncan. Dr. Duncan, we are saying, we are saying if that is your interpretation we are sorry for that. (**heckling**). No. She was saying that if you have any other question, just keep it at the end. Look here. Ladies and gentlemen...for any further questions...please, ask them at the end of the presentation. (**heckling/questions**). Dr. Duncan. Dr. Duncan, we are not here to set the pace for anything like that. So we are saying, let us have the discussion (**heckling**).

TAPE ENDS

To the best of my knowledge and recollection these 6 pages represent a complete and accurate *verbatim* report of the tape recording made at the Public Meeting held at Knockalva Technical High School on Friday February 2nd at 5:30 pm.

.....

Ravidya Burrowes