

VERBATIM NOTES OF THE PUBLIC PRESENTATION OF THE
PROPOSED QUARRYING AND MINERAL PROCESSING AT RIO
BUENO QUARRY, DRY HARBOUR MOUNTAIN, DISCOVERY BAY,
ST. ANN HELD AT THE CLOCK TOWER BEACH HOUSE DISCOVERY
BAY ON FRIDAY, JULY 12, 2019, COMMENCING AT 5:49 P.M.

PRESENT WERE:

The Panel

Mr. D. Johnson - The Chairman
Mr. R. Edwards
Dr. C Campbell
Mr. K. Sweet
Mr. J. Angulo

Participants

Mr. M. Nelson
Mr. A. Anderson
Mr. M. Hopwood
Mr. P. Muschett
Ms. K. Lyons
Mr. B. Smith
Mrs. F. Evans
Mrs W. Smith
Ms. W. Lee
Mr. H. James
Mr. M. Bryson
Mr. A. Holmes
Mrs. M. Morris
Mr. C. trench
Mr. G. Smith
Mr. D. Whyte
Dr. E. Garraway
Mr. Q. Morgan

And other members.

The Chairman: Good afternoon everyone and friends. It is now 5:49 p.m. and this meeting is duly called to order.

My name is Delroy Johnson, I am the Minister for the Discovery Bay Charge United Church and I am the Chairman for this afternoon proceedings.

Permit me to extend hearty welcome to one and all to the public presentation of the Environmental Impact Assessment for the proposed quarrying and mineral processing at Rio Bueno, Quarry, Dry Harbour Mountain, Discovery Bay, and St. Ann. We are engaged in this process as a part of the licensing to be granted by NEPA. Over this time, we would hear NEPA, we will hear an overview of the project, we will have a presentation by the EIA and we will have questions and answers at a certain point.

Permit me to introduce some people to you this afternoon. To my far left Dr. Carlton Campbell, CL Environmental Company Limited, Mr. Jesue Angulo, and to my right, immediate right Mr. Ronald Edwards Jamaica World and my far right Mr Kashif Sweet. And from NEPA, we have Miguel Nelson. I also want to acknowledge the presence of Councillor Mr. Carlton Rickets.

May I invite you at this joint to join me in prayer? Let us pray.

(Mr. Delroy Johnson prayed)

The Chairman: Friends, at this point I will yield and welcome Mr. Miguel Nelson to offer statements from the National Environment and Planning Agency.

Mr. Nelson: Good afternoon. Okay, so statement from the National Environment and Planning Agency, at the public

meeting for the proposed mining and mineral processing at Rio Bueno, Quarry, Dry Harbour Mountain, Discovery Bay St. Ann by Bengal Development Limited.

On the 3rd of March, 2014, the National Environment and Planning Agency received an environmental permit application from Bengal Development Limited. Application number 201-406-017-EP-000-40 for mining and mineral processing and associated works at Rio Bueno Quarry Site Dry Harbour Mountain Discovery Bay, St. Ann.

The information submitted in support of the application was reviewed and the decision arrived at that an Environmental Impact Assessment would be required for the proposed project. As part of the EIA process, a public meeting is required to be undertaken.

This public meeting is preliminary action and no final application as yet been made on the application submitted.

Participants should note that this public meeting is deemed important, and the outcome from the meeting will be submitted to the Natural Resources Conversation Authority to guide the decision making process.

The agency's representatives are here to support the process and to ensure public meeting is undertaken in accordance with the terms outlined in the document entitled; Guidelines for Public Consultation, EIA Application.

As a regulator, the agency must remain objective and as such, the team will not participate in making comments or answering questions related to the development.

Of note, is the process with respect public presentation and the agency wishes to highlight the following, with respect to this public presentation:

A copy of the verbatim minutes of the meeting is to be submitted to the agency by applicant within seven (7) days of the meeting being held.

The public is allowed 21 days from the date of this meeting to provide the written comments to the agency.

All comments received by the agency will be collated and sent to the applicant for responses to be provided.

The issues raised along with the responses provided by the applicant are incorporated in the respective submissions to the various committees and authority, and will facilitate

the deliberations on the technical merit of the project.

A recommendation will be made to the Natural Resources Conservation Authority, which is the body responsible for making the final decision.

Please note carefully that the final decision on the application is the sole responsibility of the NRCA.

Written comments may also be submitted to the application Secretariat Branch, the Agency, at 10 Caledonia Avenue Kingston 5, or via electronic mail to: applications@nepa.gov.jm so that is it, applications@nepa.gov.jm

The agency views this public presentation or public consultation process as extremely important in the process of decision making.

Public presentation provides an additional opportunity for stakeholders to hear concerns, comments, opinions or views on development projects and afford the applicant an opportunity to respond or address these concerns, comments, opinion or views.

Again, comments, opinions or views maybe submitted to the application Secretariat Branch at the agency, at 10 Caledonia Avenue Kingston 5, or via e-mail at applications@nepa.gov.jm

Finally, please be reminded that the Environmental Impact Assessment Report for the proposed project is available for access by the public at the following locations:

The St. Ann's Bay Municipal Corporation at Arscott Drive, Main Street St Ann's Bay St. Ann, the

University of the West Indies, Discovery Bay Marine Lab, at Queens Highway St. Ann, the Rio Bueno Primary School at Rio Bueno Trelawny, the Rio Bueno Police Station the Rio Bueno Trelawny and on the National Environment and Planning Agency's website. So that is www.nepa.gov.jm and there is a tag that says EIA, if you click on that you will see the documentation.

Thank you very much

The Chairman: Thank you, Mr. Nelson. Moving forward we will now hear from Mr. Kashif Sweet as he gives us an overview of the project.

Mr. Sweet: Sure. Can everyone hear me okay? Do I need the mike?

Participants: Yes.

Mr. Sweet: Okay, I am not good with these things, but I will try my best with the microphone.

How is everyone doing this evening?
Good, good.

So I am Kashif Sweet one of the co-founders of Jamaica World. I want to give you a brief overview of the project of who we are, of what we are doing here and why we are here and we want to address some of the concerns from the public.

You know, I got a lot of coaching of what should be said, and how it should be said and who the audience is. And I am terrible at coaching. So, forgive me for those who tried to coach me, but I am going to be radically transparent, right.

If I live in this area, back when it was previously mined or quarried, I

am sorry, I have to make sure that I use the word quarry. I will be really, really weary of this project. Let me say that again. If I lived in this area, I will be really wary of this project. And my point is, my major point is that this is 180 degrees different from the last project, alright. And we, want to make sure that we get across in the presentation. So without further ado, who we are?

Jamaica World is a start-up company that owns one asset, which is the land asset in Rio Bueno 572, acres. We are—have a vision for the company and quarrying is a small part of that vision. But it is an integral part of it.

I tell people this and they get kind of rub the wrong way. The quarrying

business is a tough business, right, it is not a beautiful business, but it has great impact to the local areas, in that, it can prepare the area for development. Like this site is a unique site, okay, everyone in the room knows about the cliff and bluff and the beautiful cliff side here. Our ultimate goal is to develop the land site. And in order for us to do that we need to prepare the site, and in order for that preparation comes extraction.

So how do we finance the business for development without being beholding to a lot of third party people. We self-fund that development, and in order to do that quarrying is an integral part.

Now, previously as I stated before, the approach was absolutely terrible

and we have gone through step by step over the past eight years to make sure we address the concerns that have been previously voiced by the local community.

So quarrying is the first step which we will talk about, alternative energy which we are in the midst of discussion with partnership to bring cheaper energy to local community is in the works and a much longer project that will happen over time, especially the economic zone in order to bring commercial and residential development to the area.

So to that point, what we are talking about specifically, is the Jamaica World Quarry, everything else is in concept stage, the alternative energy portion will be up and running hopefully within the next three to

four years, if all else works in compliance with the local community and with NEPA.

The quarry is structured as so. I am one of the co-founders and I sit on the Board of Directors, my other co-founders sit on the board of directors and we are looking to add strategic partners both from the business world and the local community.

The CEO is very experienced, Mr. Ronald Edwards he has had 20 plus years of industry experience as a Deputy Commissioner in the Mines and Geology Division, but he actually spent those 20 years inspecting quarry sites, what they are doing right, what they are doing wrong, what are the penalty for doing wrong. This is not an accident, we specifically made this higher in order to make sure

that we are in compliant with all the guidelines of the operation of the quarry.

Issues and rules from EPSA, we are going to get into this—we are going to talk about EPSA momentarily, but as a summary, ESPA is a global contract earth movement, they are one of the largest independent global contract earth moving providers in Europe. They are in fourteen countries begin with a sense of scale and one of their sites in Latin America they have 600 employees, we are nowhere near that many, but we are going to have some employment in the local community but they have the experience to make sure that a quarry site is quarried the right way with the right amount of people, with the right employment of the local people, the right training, for the local

people, and the right reclamation plant to make sure that after the quarrying is finished, and especially, in our situation, the land can be used for future development. We did this specifically because of the concerns from the community about the previous project, right, none of this is accidental. And here we won't go to that given the time, but this is the rest of the operation that we are looking to build out.

We are looking to have an orderly, strategic, cutting edge quarry operation over the life of the permit, okay. This lays out the approach.

Instead of haphazardly extracting, blasting, gather boulders you are not hearing about, the rest of the remains of the property we are specifically

building, extracting and creating benches within the quarry phase. Those benches will enable development. Now development could be a scary thing you may think tall buildings, you may think office buildings, residential. But development is also when you are plan a development it is community parks, conservation areas, it is local businesses for people to actually come in and be able to have a walking community right, all of that is integral right, this is not fluff, all of that is integral in order to have a community that thrives together, which we want, because we want to be here for a long time.

So, this approach here is approach here is the bench approach that we are looking for a quarry over the life of the permit. And this is the second

stage to give you a sense of the evolution of that bench approach.

Jamaica World as I mentioned before, the different approach is to the company requires—envision those three different segments, but we are very the clear that we want to bring, have to bring a strategic partner that have a track record and the experience.

(People entering the building)

I will wait for people to come in, there are some chairs up here.

We went all the way to Madrid Spain to find this local partner, okay. Now, I felt a way about this actually. I said, you know how many well-skilled Jamaicans are ready, willing and able to work to quarry the site, why should we do this right? Given the history of the site right, and there is no secret around this. Given the way the

site was quarried recently, we had to bring someone in whether they be more expensive, whether they be far away. We had to bring someone in that had a concrete track record of working with the local community, reclaiming the property, quarrying in this bench-type strategy so that we can use the land to develop and integrate into the community.

So Jamaica World will be in charge of all of these strategies, the community liaisoning, the finance, all of the management proportion of the company but the operations are going to be focussed on ESPA.

Those who are in the room right now, will be the lead point of contact. Steadman will be on the ground, he will be on the ground, when he is not travelling the rest of the world, we

will have direct point of contact with him every day. Our CEO who was previously an inspector will have the inspection on our own site to make sure that, if he is the CEO his reputation is not going to be tarnished with bad practices. So this is the structure, this is the team that we are going to be building out and there will be local employment from the community which we will get into in a couple minutes.

So this is the workforce, and this workforce is the top of the workforce, I am not allowed to say this, but there will be more jobs, and take a lot quantify, but there will be more jobs than the 21 job that you see here and that is important to us. You know I was just telling the co-founder—we won't get into that, but the local jobs are important to us. So when we

are walking in the neighbourhood, we want to see people wearing Jamaica World shirts that say we work at Jamaica World and proudly live in the area; that is important to us, this is not a fly by night thing.

I won't spend a lot of time on this page, the past history is expensive, there are many locations this is a large company that is taking on a very small project. And the reason why they are taking on a very small project is that they see that the management here is really, really focussed on building a good business first and foremost, right. We want to build a really good business; we want to build a business that is not project based. Meaning, here today for one project and gone tomorrow, we want to be here you know, over the next 20/30 years evolving to the

development stages that we previously laid out.

So here we are going to focus on the safety environment and employment focus of the business. Please keep me on track, on time, we have a question. Yes, Ma'am.

Ms. Lee: The guidelines for this meeting are 20 to 30 minutes of a simple technical presentation. You have already gone ten minutes. So I am objecting to the way that this meeting is being conducted. I don't have time to waste.

Mr. Sweet: I will wrap this up in three minutes, I promise. So, as a good track record quarries with no deaths with little numbers of very little numbers of injuries, and loss time for injuries, so this track is important to us from a safety perspective. It has all the

global certification that are needed for us to get comfortable and quite frankly I think for the community to get comfortable and running a quarry of this statute is a strategic approach.

Here the method of safety risk and environmental issues and how they identify what the approaches to eliminating and then, and then moving forward how we learn from those issues. And from an environmental perspective, we are keenly focussed on protecting the integrity of the bench quarrying approach in order for future development.

If you don't remember anything else— and I am wrapping up I promise, is that we quarrying is a small part of Jamaica World overall programme we are bringing a focused, committed

operator for the global presence with the track record to make sure that we do it the right way and not the way it was before.

We are focussed on hiring in the local community right, and we going to make sure that, the local personnel, the training and supplying of the local personal, mentoring and promoting the local staff make sure some technical skills are there not for the local staff, and not just held on by ESPA that is important. So that is what continues creating doing jobs overtime for the local community and not just from ESPA.

And here this is walk through the competence training from day one to becoming a senior manager at ESPA in Jamaica for local employment and that is all I have.

So I am going to pass it on to Carlton for the next segment.

Dr. Campbell: Good afternoon. Overview of the project, main findings from the existing environment, public participation detailing impacts, analysis of project alternatives and the proposed environmental monitoring for this project.

What is the rationale? Expanding tourism sector and other construction activities that we need. Crushed aggregate is hard to get from the eastern end of the island because of the drought and also in terms of transportation.

River sourcing is largely in the eastern part of the island.

Another rationale that limestone aggregates have gained acceptance, you have seen it in a lot of the

construction activities that we have had in Jamaica in terms of the roads and buildings. And it is also imperative for economic development.

Ms. Lee: You forgot to say profit.

Dr. Campbell: Yes, and profit. There is nothing wrong with that. So the area here outlines generally where the quarry is supposed to take place. And forgive me there is an area here that is supposed to be conserved as a part of the discussions we have had with NEPA, we have a conservation area. And you will note this eastern end where a lot of the animals that were found previously that is where they were found away from it.

And this is a drone imagery to show you the area that we are looking at, you can know, we stay away. And the quarrying is done in phases which is

important, so we go along phase one, phase two, phase three, and as you go along at the end of each phase then rehabilitation will be conducted so that there is no exposed area, there is no problem with dusting, the place looks properly organized and planned.

There is a basic layout picture we have, there is a general area for the offices, you have the quarrying equipment here, you have tank for water and a tank for fuel storage and also there will be a general drain around the site to prevent run-off and to control sedimentation.

So it is an open pit quarry, it will have as usual existing quarry hopper vibrating grizzle and the rest, it has conveyors to move between where the hopper and to pile the material into

areas into different sizes that will be created.

I spoke about the sedimentation pond and portable water will be trucked to the site. As you know, it is difficult to get potable water in this area. For the wastewater you have grease traps in there, you have kitchen on site and we spoke about the septic tank, the evaporation belt for the sewage.

Site access has been changed based on discussions with the National Works Agency and the traffic—the truck traffic would minimize in terms of the operations because of where it is position where it will be getting on to main road. So you would naturally have some buffer between vegetation, the open pit that is there before.

So generally, this is the route as proposed. From here go all the way

down to this point then turn following the highway, back to the Port.

Solid waste will be collected by a private contractor, as you know, the site as is, there is lot of indiscriminate and illegal dumping on site. Now it will be a—they are able to be managed much better.

Generally, there is no real solid waste being generated from the operation because each material will be use, and generally, it will be in basically piles, five stockpiles and general sizes. Of course, it will be covered and sufficiently wetted so that you don't have any issues with dusting and that you have experienced before.

Fuel and other chemicals will be stored on platforms. Findings from existing, of course hydrology there

is no gully or rivers on the site. We looked at air quality, these are the results, you notice the stations, in terms of mixtures.

Lady: Where the people them live? Go back.

Dr. Campbell: The houses are down here, the houses are here so if you look, these green and yellow dots...

Lady: Who is on top of the mountain?

Dr. Campbell: Yes, but this covers it.

Lady: You think so, you think so.

Dr. Campbell: Afterwards we can have this discussion. We will have the discussions after during the questions and answers section when I am finish, right. The position of it is that for the PM 10, which is the larger particles, we had exceedances at station 8 and for the smaller particles which is PM 2.5 a station 5

and 6. Five and 6 is the fine particles and 8 up here is where it is.

(Cross talk)

We are not disputing we are telling you what is found. But that is existing.

(Cross talk)

When I am finish with the presentation we will have that.

Noise we have issue with noise, residential areas, but these are mostly located around where the highway runs, motor vehicle noise.

Other pollution sources as we spoke before, we had illegal dumping that was removed some examples of what currently on the site, or was on site, I should say, and the areas...

Lady: That should be an existing government problem.

Lady: People cannot dump in my yard; you think I would let people dump in my yard.

Dr. Campbell: Anyway, fauna and flora zones we looked at that, we have a disturbed northern forest, you have the dry limestone, savannah grass land in here and of course the woodland. 137 plant species were identified in the area, then endemism was relatively low, ten per cent. Along the bluff generally mostly invasive species inside the dry limestone forest of course, we found endemic species some orchids. Predominately in the grassy areas a mixture of dry limestone and vegetation. Average height of the species were about one meter, and they

transitioned three to four meters going into the woodland area.

In terms of invertebrates there were butterflies four of them were endemic, most widespread not assigned as special conservation status. There is one in particular under the Jamaican law is listed as vulnerable, there are also some damselflies that are found, wide distributions are on the site. In terms of endemics amphibians there were seven of them out of the ten that were found, three of them were considered endangered. Reptiles nineteen species were recorded eighteen endemic and of course, the Jamaica boa which is, as I was saying to you, which is further east of where we are looking at.

Participant: That is not true, sir. They come out on the road all the while and I have

taken two from my house personally, I have it on video.

Dr. Campbell: As I said, at the questions and answers we can have that discussion. Avifauna sixteen of the thirty were endemic. We looked at the social area males and females, as we can see the population has continuously grown over the time period, not within a protected area, not located any special conservation area.

Lady: It is recommended.

Dr. Campbell: Well at this point it is not, okay. Historical and archaeological sites way back when, but none were observed when the survey was done by the JNHT Jamaica National Heritage Trust. Some surveys were conducted from as Far East as Golden Sunrise to as far as West as Bengal Beach majority were in the 36-50 years age, groups. Golden

Sunrise persons had no concern, the concern about potential at Bengal Beach potential health risk associated with dust all concerns...

Participants: Who you spoke to up there? (Heckling)

Mr. Hopwood: Who you spoke to there?

Dr. Campbell: Orderly meeting.

Mr. Hopwood: Who you spoke to there, orderly meeting you want we broke up it backside, this backside nah guh gwaan here old man, naw guh happen, take it from me, naw guh happen.

(Cross talk)

The Chairman: Please, the process must be managed. There will be a time for question.

Participant: But people don't have time. We have things to do.

The Chairman: I am sorry, but in the interim you have to wait.

Participant: I don't want to hear anything more from him. What he is saying is that...

The Chairman: I am sorry, but you have to wait until the question and answer times comes around for you to make—for questions, please.

Dr. Campbell: All concerns about dust and noise in the Bengal Community, Queens Drive, Bengal Estate area, concerns about vibration and possible damage through their property. Potential impacts have been identified noise from heavy equipment, noise protection, the type of equipment used, the operations of the quarrying time, in terms of air quality. We looked at the type of equipment that will be used to control dust, in terms of wetting, covering and of course, when you do the phased way of doing the quarrying, of course, then you won't remove all the

vegetation at once, so that will reduce the amount of dust that easily entrained.

Persons spoke about drainage having sedimentation ponds that in case any run off from the quarry that is captured and is dealt with on site. Of course, for the campsite, rubbish and solid waste and of course they have skips; and for wastewater generated during site construction and preparation of course you have the Porto-potty. Storage of equipment and material, material, areas away from drainage channels, storage of fuels on hard sand so that it does not get percolated into the soil or the ground. Bulk fluids will be stored in areas enclosed and properly bonded so as to contain. Transportation of the raw material and equipment and during site clearance, of course, you may

have paths so we don't go through new paths and destroy the areas that we want to conserve. Trucks will be parked on site and not on the highway, and of course, when you are moving heavy equipment then you remove them at early morning time.

In terms of the flora established buffers, as we said they have been identified for conservation, so we stay off those areas. As I said before, staged sequential clearing.

In terms of the fauna, some work was done on the butterfly so there is some information at the back of the EIA to tell us about their presence in terms of the numbers any boa or Coney that is found during this time will be relocated.

Lady:

To where, to where?

Dr. Campbell: To the eastern portion of the site that is not going to be disturbed.

Lady: You don't understand ecology.

Dr. Campbell: Okay, Wendy, at the end of the meeting we will have that discussion.

Health and safety. We talk about the punitive dust and work as in terms as equipment that leads to where. Social 18 persons were employed during the bushing.

During the operation, model was used to look at the contribution of dust from the operation of the quarry, and then we, based on the mitigation the type of equipment that is used to capture dust at source, the haulage roads will be wetted and compacted to prevent that. Limiting the speed of the trucks along that area.

Participants: Laughter.

Dr. Campbell: On the quarry, 25 km on the quarry side. We are talking about dusting here, dusting. Quarry road is the one that will likely be responsible for the dusting. Transporting on the main road it will be the covering of the trucks. I am not trying to judge; I am just presenting what I have well.

Noise, we look at noise there, we used a noise model and we realized that there will be issues with noise, so there are some mitigated steps in terms of putting noise barriers keeping it behind the buff, and the type of equipment that you are going to use.

Blasting we all know there are issues with blasting, there are ways to do it properly that would be enforced. And as I was saying, as part of the mitigation we also have surveys that

could be done before the blasting. So we will know if there is an effect on your house. Vibration, in terms of vibration when we looked at the vibration, the nearest residents in different locations and we found that there is the possibility that there will be an issue with vibration. And we have dealt with how we deal with those.

Drainage and water quality as we said, we won't block up sink holes, we will ensure that any potential pollutant won't get entrained into the water and get into the sink holes.

In terms of wastewater, as you said there will be a evapo transportation bed that will deal with the wastewater issues. In terms of storage you saw that before, and in terms of the flora dust has the potential to impact

photosynthesizes. So in terms of reducing the amount of dust then of course we will have wetting use some recycling water to help to control the dust and of course, as I said before the type of equipment that is going to be used will capture the dust at source.

Employment, we expect some, as you have before 21, but a part of that we will have induced and indirect employment so it will be a little more than the 21 that was listed there. Of course aesthetics, you will benching and so forth.

In terms of rehabilitation we spoke about the benching also replanting type of trees there are certain vegetation that we want to replant, looking at how the angles or the slope prevent them from paving.

Alternatives, no-action alternatives were looked at. The proposed project as described in the EIA, one that proposed the location of some flora. Proposed specific areas of mining which this is really a hybrid of it. Using the area for eco-tourism.. (Laughter) I am happy that you find it funny. Preferred alternative one that was being proposed with the possibility of using it for renewable energy. To get to the renewable energy you have to set the site to put them in.

(Cross talk)

Anyway, in terms of construction there are certain monitoring activity that we want to do, and different persons in terms of the regular working hours, we don't want to be

working during times that persons need to rest.

Trucks will be covered and not overladen, flagmen in place of course, the type of material will be recorded. In terms of—during site, you have monitoring by the Ministry of Health to make sure that the sewage system is operating properly. You also want to ensure proper traffic management. And a part of this, it is important that in terms of the monitoring especially during the operation and during the soil preparation then there is an aspect where we will also ask communities to help in terms of their issues of if they see anything that is out of the norm to provide their feedback. Mr. Edwards will tell you that the plan that we have is to have an area where you can lodge your complaints, it is

being dealt with, logged and dealt with in a speedy and efficient manner.

Lady: We are doing that now.

Dr. Campbell: Thank you. Monitoring and suppliers; part of it would be doing some water quality management which is important, just to ensure that the operation of the quarry is not impacting the water quality site. During operation, noise, you look at noise, do the measurement to the community to see if there is an impact from the operation of the quarry on the community.

Lady: What happens when there is?

Dr. Campbell: Questions and answers. Training of staff, vehicle repairing, we do it at the proper location. And during the decommissioning phase we want to ensure that the relevant government authorities ensure that the plan that

is proposed is being held to, and they do it to the best of their ability. NEPA and other agencies Mines and Geology will ensure of that.

Participant: How much money?

Dr. Campbell: To do what?

Participant: NEPA will get?

Dr. Campbell: I beg your pardon?

Dr. Campbell: That is not me you are addressing, certainly not. I never asked you who pay you, right, so don't disrespect me.

In terms of re-vegetation and rehabilitation plan NEPA will do spot checks to ensure that that is being done. Ensure that there is stabilizing of rock faces and make sure that the mined out areas that are or quarry areas are covered.

Daily and this is by the client and of course, persons living around will see if this is being done in terms of you are having issues while the quarry is operating.

Make sure that there are flagmen. Ensure that licensed scrap metal dealers are hired. Ensure that you have health and safety persons, proper PPE's.

Thank you very much.

Mr. B. Smith: Who we can direct our questions to now?

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS SESSION:

The Chairman: Ladies and gentlemen I sense your urgency in need to ask questions. However, to make the process meaningful, we are going to have to do it in an orderly fashion. So please listen, I am hearing all that you are saying, but if the outburst continues

we are not going to have a meaningful process.

Participant: Watch yah. (Heckling)

The Chairman: You are not listening, I was saying to you, if the process continues the process is going to break down, because you will not hear the questions and the response won't get to come. So if you would merely listen, and I am asking you when you get the opportunity to ask your questions, you will be allowed a follow-up question should you have one. But we have to get to as many questions as possible, good.

I see somebody with the mike at back, could you identify yourself please? Identify yourself please.

Mr. Henderson: Alrick Henderson, could you just go back to slide number 14 for me, because as far, as the first part of

it was concerned, this is a shortage of aggregates for the building industry. Yes, where does the green road goes to? The green road goes to the port, so where are we building these houses, why is it going to the port? This is not for building here.

Mr. Sweet: Just to be clear, the road is set up to go to the port however that is not the only place where the exports will be transferred.

(Cross talk.)

I will take all the questions; I am not in a rush, so please clarify your question.

Participant: What percentage going directly?

Mr. Sweet: That is going to be market driven.

Mr. Sweet: Hold on. I will give everyone a chance, hold on please hold on, we will give you the mic.

Mr. Hopwood: I am not holding on man, I want to say something. My name is Martin Hopwood and I am going to be your immediate neighbour, and I am going to see to it at the highest office in this country that this thing doesn't happen. (Applause) Right, because I am telling you, you are going to destroy the whole environment with this thing. I have lived where I lived for my entire life..

The Chairman: Mr. Hopwood.

Mr. Hopwood: What you want man, make me talk. And when Kaiser Bauxite starts to mine bauxite up there, I have been polluted by dust, coming from—dry dust up there. We were assured by nobody else but Don Vassell who was the American man that started that thing. There will be no dust it has determinate the value of my place, no house can build

up there, I cannot sell my land for housing because nobody can live up there because bauxite dust in dem house morning noon and night, including my own. My pickney dem use to red when they were small because when they play on the veranda bauxite dust you have to hose it off with power hose. And this is the same thing that is going to happen here. The road to Rio Bueno, the road to Rio Bueno hold on nuh man...

(Cross talk)

Mr. Sweet: Please, let Mr. Hopwood finish.

Mr Hopwood: ...the road to Rio Bueno it a mash up right now, when you go through the wet land it is sinking. You just worked it out a while ago, you will be putting two hundred and fifty odd trucks per day on that road carrying fifty odd ton of aggregate. When you

reach at the bottom of the Rio Bueno Highway where the trucks then come off, coming from Trelawny down that four lane highway, you will be turning right into sharp right, you know how much accident you going to have right there so?

Lady: It is already happening.

Mr. Hopwood: When dem guys coming off of that hill at 70 miles an hour and you are turning a truck with 25 kilometres per hour across there, everyday a man is going to dead out there.

(Cross talk)

Mr Sweep: Okay, could you give me one second so that I can address some of the points that Mr. Hopwood brought up. Okay, I want to make sure that I address it. Mr. Hopwood, I heard a lot about you.

Mr. Hopwood: Okay, I am glad, you just start, I don't need microphone my voice is loud enough you can hear what I am saying.

Mr. Sweet: I gave respect to you so if you don't mind I would like to respond.

Mr. Hopwood: Gwaan.

Mr. Sweet: Thank you. I heard a lot about you that you are a keen business person with a reputation that proceeds you.

Participants: We don't want fi hear all of that.

Mr. Sweet: Let me finish. I can't change the past Mr. Hopwood...

Mr. Hopwood: But you were going to give us... words alone mean nothing, because I have been there done that I know what you can do.

Mr Sweet: One second, Mr. Hopwood, okay, I can't change what happened in the past, okay. We have been trying, the ownership before me, and the

ownership with me, has been trying and has failed over and over again to make sure that we get the concerns that have been brought up addressed with this EIA. We not Cartellone okay, we are far from them. I am telling you, we are not, okay. So, all we can do, is address these concerns, tell you that we are going to be living and breathing in the neighbourhood okay. If you let me, Mr. Hopwood, if you let me move in, we are going to be living and breathing in the neighbourhood. My fiancé, my future kids will be on the beach, hopefully next to you. So all we can say is that we are not the Cartellone from the past, we have spent over nine years addressing these issues to make sure that we meet ever point here that is being addressed in the room. But we can't change the past and I understand there

are scars. Someone else has the mike
please go ahead, sir.

Mr. Muschett: My name is Paul Muschett. You talk
about 2 million cubic yards, or 2
million tons of material possible the
same thing right, quarried for the
year, am I correct it is in here, 2
million yes? You don't know?

(Cross talk)

Dr. Campbell: If you notice there are different
rates there, depending on how they
setup the...

Mr. Muschett: No, no you have set up an estimate
based on your quarry, 2 million tons
per year. If you divide that by 365
that is 237 trucks per day, you are
not going to be carrying material
every day. So the amount of trucks on
the road will be even higher right.
So you are looking at 40 trucks per
hour, that is going to destroy the

highway, because the highway was designed for 1947 specifications okay which is probably 10-tons. You are carrying over 20-tons in each truck. It is going to destroy the highway do you have the money to replace the highway when you are finished? And on top of that, you don't have the logistics to carry that amount of material that distance every day, and you are not talking about every day, so it is probably triple the amount right so you looking at 60 trucks an hour, that is a truck a minute. You are going to block up the road it can't work...

(Cross talk)

Mr Hopwood: The road is already sinking.

Mr. Muschett: With the material you are expected to quarry a year.

Dr. Campbell: Point taken and that is something we can look at. I am just trying to say to you, in that document was a range, we are looking at a range doesn't mean that what is going to go happen. But you have just raised your concern and that is something we can look at, that is not a problem.

(Cross talk)

Mr. Sweet: Let me give you all a couple of responses to your points, because they are fair points. The math is a little curious...

Mr. B. Smith: I don't need a mic.

Mr. Sweet: Let me give the lady a minute and then I will come directly to you. Thank you.

Lady: There is also a gentleman here from Tankweld.

Mr. Sweet: No problem. So I go here, your name sir.

Mr. B. Smith: Bobby Smith

Mr. Sweet: Bobby Smith and then the gentleman from Tankweld. If you will just give me one second. So really quickly, the math is a little curious, but we can follow up. To be fair...

Participant: If you divide two million by twenty...

Mr. Sweet: ...that road, the aggregate from that road came from the site, so if we had the ability to build part of that road, why couldn't we widen the road?

Participant: Because there is a swamp under the road.

Mr Sweet: With the proper engineering it can be filled.

Participant: You have to make a bridge.

Lady: You cannot fill it.

Mr. Sweet: One second, but to your earlier point, the two million tons per year anyone can put anything on paper, but this is market driven.

The Chairman: Before we get to the next question...

Participant: Let the lady talk.

Participant: The lady waiting.

The Chairman: You are not going to be unruly, it is not about me, I am the Chairman of the meeting, and you are not going to be unruly it's not about me, I am the Chairman of the meeting.

Participant: But there is nobody unruly.

The Chairman: The Steno Writer is taking notes, if she cannot hear, she cannot write your concerns nor your questions and so it will not get to the relevant people that is all I am saying to you. Let us conduct ourselves well so that all

the concerns and questions can be heard and documented.

(Cross talk)

Participant: Let the lady talk.

The Chairman: No, you are not going to direct the meeting. Miss, please go ahead.

Mr. Sweet: Please go ahead. Ma'am, what is your name?

Ms. Lyons: My name is Kimberly Lyons water resources specialist, and I am a resident. I have a question regarding this. Can I ask the consultant to bring back up the slide where you have the concentration for the air quality, please?

Participant: The table number 19.

Ms. Lyons: So, these are the observed concentrations?

Dr. Campbell: Yes.

Ms. Lyons: And then in the report you did some model results where you do the cumulative impacts, this operation on top of what is already existing. Is this table seven point one on page 253 in the EIA report? It seems very relevant and it is seems to be the main issues for the community that this table that I am referring to here, was left out of the presentation because it shows that the model run, the maximum concentration don't just exceeds the national air quality standard I mean, where you have them it is staggering it amazing really. So, I mean, what do you have to say about that? What does NEPA have to say about that?

Dr. Campbell: And that is why I say to you, the model run gave you what the case is, you put in the mitigation steps and what I probably should have gotten the

air quality person to do is with the mitigation steps to see what the numbers are. There are mitigation steps based on the information.

Ms. Lyons: The mitigation measures are going to bring down the concentrations from almost 400 micrograms per cubic meters to 150?

Dr. Campbell: Yes, we were looking at...

Mr. Smith: You cannot answer that please

Dr. Campbell: Sir, I will give your chance so please. So, a part of it is the quarry road that was modelled that would have normally would have been dusty. What we have done is to lock them to agree to get it with river shingle alright, so that will reduce the amount, because a lot of that the dust, is trucked a lot of it is the trucks driving up and down in during the quarrying. And also, increase the

amount of wetting. You notice we say four to six and if needed then we increase it some more. So I am not concern about..

(Cross talk)

The type of equipment that is going..

(Cross talk)

Sir, give me some respect, thank you. A part from the equipment that we are going to use, as we said we carry somebody who have had the experience, the type of equipment will capture the dust at source, so it allows you to reduce the amount of pollution coming off.

Mr. Sweet: Let's take this gentleman in the back, and then I take this question right here. What is your name ma'am—sorry, I want this question in the back what is your name, sir.

Mr. B. Smith: My name is Bobby Smith; I have two houses on Bengal...

Mr. Sweet: You are doing very well, sir.

Mr. B. Smith: Thank you, sir.

Lady: Not for long.

(Heckling)

Participant: You are going to mash up his business.

Mr Sweet: Can you let him finish.

Mr. B Smith: Fair is fair, I know you guys want to mine and do all your stuff.

Dr. Campbell: Quarry.

Mr. Sweet: Quarry to be specific.

Mr. B. Smith: Well let time tell you something, I don't need that. Let me tell you something first thing first, is that the size company that you are, there is no way you are coming here so to seek a Jamaican market, so that is a no, no, I don't even believe that. So

second, based on the structure and the size of this company so you are export driven and that is a given and we know that. Now, the best wharf to export on is Tankweld wharf which is right beside us. Now let me tell us something that is going to just murder us and we have a whole heap of rental properties, a whole heap of tourism properties, a whole heap of people life in there so and the whole of the coast going down right beside the quarry going down. Now all of these people must be affected by two hundred loads of trucks per day on a loaded truck going to the wharf..

Mr Hopwood: What about the water truck them that are coming up back?

Mr. B. Smith: ..going over the wet land that is a murder, and then make the turn to the Tankweld wharf is immediate death.

There is no way two hundred trucks can do this, the logistics are impossible. So first thing first, there is no way you will be able to put out that deh vision that you have in terms of the quantities that you were talking about. And when this nice gentleman is talking about—let me tell you why I can talk about it. I own a quarry, I operate a quarry and I know what it is like with dust control. And let me tell you something, there is no dust control. You are going to talk all kind of stuff how you are going to spray water and use shingle and you use that, all of dem something deh pon paper, you talking about equipment that control the dust at the point, that is rubbish. Let me tell you something I have up-to-date equipment, portable equipment that I use, and dem spit out

dust just like everything else. You have all suction and water on it, dust is coming out of it. Let me tell where most of the dust comes from.

Mr. Sweet: Bobby I want to make sure that I get all your comments so can you give one more point, because I want to get to Fiona's question and I want to respond to yours.

(Heckling by Participants)

Mr. B. Smith: The dust from the mining is going to be horrendous, is the movement of the trucks dem, dem two hundred trucks that drive on the mining road fi come pon fi we road fi go pon the wharf right side as we, fi slip off over there suh fi load on the boat, how the hell you are going to control that dust? That is impossible, so with all them crap, a bullshit that.

Mr. Sweet: Mr. Smith, let's be respectful please. Let me just address a couple of points...

(Cross talk)

I find it...

(Cross talk)

It seems like a reasonable and successful business person I find it a little bit ironic how adverse you are to the project being a quarry operator with two homes on the coast. But to be fair, right...

Mr. B. Smith: Fair to whom

Mr. Sweet: Fair to the community, right people want to be in the community, the employees' right, enjoy the communal success, that your quarry has...

(Cross talk)

Participant: Hold on a minute, I put two JPL speakers on and I disturb all of my

neighbours. I am currently looking to move right...

Mr. Sweet: Why?

Participant: Because I am disturbing people. I find it ironic that when I had fireworks I was drawn to a meeting and I had to stop because the whole neighbourhood they heard it. And you are going to tell me you are going to blast, you are going to blast this is ridiculous.

Mr. Sweet: You are talking about the music or you are talking about the...

(Cross talk)

Sir, we need to get the Fiona, out of respect, please, we need to get to Fiona's questions...

Participant: I used two JPL speakers for my wedding and I disturb everybody what the hell fifty trucks going to do. You crazy.

(Cross talk)

Participant: They can't do that this is madness.

Mr. Sweet: Fiona, let's give Fiona the floor and the respect please.

Mrs. Evans: Okay, my name is Fiona Evans, I run a school in Runaway Bay and also own property in Rio Bueno, I have a number of concerns. The first one is a national zoning concern. So I am on page 192 (4.3.2.3) of your zoning policy note that the project area falls within an area classified as undeveloped coast and there are two policies UC4 and UC5, I think everybody in the room should be interested in. So the policy UC4 notes that only those forms of development which would not result in any significant alteration to the existing topography or any reduction in significant sums of vegetation will be permitted. So NEPA is in the

room tonight, NEPA going forward I hope that they pay particular attention to policy UC4. Policy, UC5 no development will be allowed in these wooded areas which would adversely affect the originality or integrity to these areas. So as far as I see on those two points alone as dictated by policy UC4 and 5, quarry should not be approved as such.

(Applause)

Participants: Hear! Hear!

Mr. Sweet: I will give Fiona the respect to a response, we have to give her the respect. And then Bobby, I like talking to you, I will call back on you.

(Heckling)

Fiona thank you for your diligent question, that is it?

(Cross talk)

Mrs. Evans: I suppose my question to you was, how would you respond to that?

Dr. Campbell: How do I respond, that policy is a draft policy...

Participants: No, no.

Dr. Campbell: Hold on, hold on, may I finish, Wendy. It was confirmed after the document was prepared right.

Ms. Lee: In the year 2000.

Dr. Campbell: But since that there is another one that is being worked on.

Ms. Lee: And it does not make any difference.

Dr. Campbell: It does. As I said before there is an area there that has been identified as a...

Ms. Lee: That is a convenience.

Dr. Campbell: No, that was a discussion that NEPA and whoever else was the stakeholder had a discussion and the parish council, there is an area that is

identified on the property as a conservation area.

Mrs. Evans: No, this is not related to that, this is talking about national zoning and I said the document has been updated or changed to some minor degrees. These are principals underline since those statements were made, have those two principles changed?

Dr Campbell: As far as I know, it has changed in terms...

Mrs Evans: It has not changed.

Dr Campbell: It has changed in terms of the discussion that NEPA has had...

Mrs Evans: Be the zoning...

(Cross talk)

Dr. Campbell: NEPA is responsible for - they call it zoning right, and there were discussions when the thing came up way back in 2010.

Mrs Evans: As far as I understand it these were...

Dr Campbell: I am telling you what I am saying, there is an area that has been identified, and that has been brought to our attention when we were doing studies for this and that has been, and it is in the document, I am sorry that I don't have it, that has been identified as an area for conservation, that is what the discussion outside of us were. And we got advice we sought to find out what is the zonation meant and we were pointed that that area is the conservation area. Bearing in mind out of that 250 acres we are using quarter of it for the quarrying, the rest of that area is being left alone.

Ms. Evans: This does not relate to conservation area at all. Should I re-read the passage?

Dr Campbell: You don't need to re-read it just told you that if look in the document...

(Cross talk)

Dr. Campbell: We agree to disagree.

Ms Evans: I think we should document it, page 192 (4.3.2.3) of the zoning law, the National Zoning Law, I believe it is contravened here.

Mr. Campbell: Okay that is your opinion.

(Cross talk)

Mr. Sweet: Sorry let us give the floor to Wendy.

Ms. Lee: My name is Wendy Lee, I used to run an environmental organization and I used to be a fisheries education officer. Not only are those two polices, for the St. Ann Development Order which is here in my hand which is a legal document confirmed not provisional, passed in the year 2000 those are not the only two polices

that apply to the area. You have omitted in your analysis to mention undeveloped coast policy number 1, which says: **Development along the undeveloped coast will only be allowed if such proposal will not be detrimental to the environmental quality of the surrounding areas, or if it is in close proximity to a service centre or adequate services.**

UC3, building and structures shall be located in such a way as to avoid any adverse effect on the general character of the existing coastline in the area in which it is to be located. And then it says; **which you also omitted, the section of the coast from Rio Bueno to Discovery Bay consist of areas with trees and other coastal vegetation which are of a scenic value.** And then you quoted about the limestone forest, being you

know vegetation that takes a long time to establish and very, very hard to re-established. But I guess it doesn't really matter because your goal is the future development not the conservation of the area.

There are two other polices that you omitted which do apply. **UC-11, the undeveloped coast is of great significance from a scientific and recreational point of view. Developments will be assessed for their impact on the undeveloped coast and will not be supportive if detrimental to the area.**

Then finally, **UC-12, development will not be permitted along the undeveloped coast if it materially detracts from unspoilt scenic quality or scientific value of the area.** And your EIA has given a zero rating for

appeal aesthetic appeal impact which is completely crazy. And then, there is one other policy which you actually quote: M6 to do with minerals. **Quarries must be located in quarry zones and will not be permitted in any other location.** Now, my question is, is the site included in any area designated by the development order or as a mineral resource zone or quarry zone? These are all questions which pertains to the Town and Country Planning St. Ann Parish Development Order. It was provisional in 1998 and it was confirmed in the year 2000, and it is a law and you need to abide by it. (Applause)

Participants: Hear! Hear!

Mr. James: Good evening.

Mr. Sweet: Sir, what is your name?

Mr. James: My name is Howard James, I am at Tankweld and we have no current agreement with Jamaica World to export any aggregate to our port.

(Laughter)

Mr. Sweet: That is a great point, thank you for brining that up because we do not have an agreement with Tankweld.

Mr. Hopwood: So what you come here for...?

Mr. Sweet: Please let me finish.

Mr. Hopwood: Stop chat nonsense.

Mr. Sweet: If we don't have an agreement with Tankweld, but we have gone through all this work, why would you think that we wouldn't be interest in the local market?

Mr. B. Smith: It's peanuts in the local market.

Mr. Sweet: It is not peanuts for you, because you are in the quarry business.

Mr. B Smith: I am a bigger peanut man, you are not.
(Laughter)

Mr. Sweet: Listen to me...

Mr. B. Smith: Are you exporting the aggregates or
not?

Mr. Sweet: One day we hope to export aggregates.

Participants: No.

(Cross talk)

Mr. Sweet: Everyone seems to be focussing on
export, export, export, and I have not
argued it, you just confirmed that we
don't have any reason to export so,
any other questions in the room?

Mr. Bryson: My name is Maurice Bryson from
Discovery Bay CDC and I have listened
to your presentation. Concerned about
the matter of blasting. Have you
considered drilling, or it is only
blasting? That is the first question,
just completely drilling rather than

doing any blasting at all? The other thing is, you mentioned about dust control every four to six hours wetting..

Dr. Campbell: Or more.

Mr. Bryson: And I have thought of those trucks, I don't know what size trucks you were thinking of, but I thought of the PSI rating on those wheels, pulverising probably the material with the loads in the trucks, and also when the trucks are empty they are not going to be travelling at any slow speed and they might be kicking up a lot of dust.

Thirdly, noise pollution, are those trucks going to have any brakes on them, that would give us a lot of noise. What about the not motors that will be using to drive whether the conveyor systems or the fan feeders,

how are you going to control those noise because especially the motors, they give a continuous noise?

Mr. Edwards: Good evening ladies and gentlemen my name is Ronald Edwards, I am retired Deputy Commissioner of Mines and Mines and Geology and I will be functioning as the CEO of this company.

Participant: Oh.

Mr. Edwards: I would like to..

Mr. Hopwood: You hope so?

Mr. Edwards: I would like to—you asked about drilling and blasting. We did a sensitivity analysis, when I said we, while I was Mines and Geology. We did a sensitivity analysis and the law requires a maximum of point eight kilometre and we did a sensitive analysis of one kilometre impact on drilling and blasting, and the

document is available. And what we recognized is that there was only one house and it was not being lived in that will impact in anyway slightly. Let me make one thing very clear, ladies and gentlemen, and Kashif said it. We all know when Cartellone was there, we had to set up a monthly monitoring committee on that operation because of how it was sited, where the crushing plant was basically on the highway.

Mr. B Smith: No, it was not, sir.

Mr. Edwards: I beg your pardon?

Mr. B. Smith: It was not. The asphalt plant was on the highway, the crushing plant was near but most of the mining was done up in the hills..

Mr. Edwards: I know where the mines—I am just saying that where the crushing plant was sited was very close to the

highway and that was a major issue. This plant in terms of location will be at least one mile away from where it was sited when...

(Cross talk)

I am saying that the impact, that in terms of visual intrusion, the noise dust and all that it will be removed, if we go into that direction in a north westerly direction at least one mile away.

Participant: We are getting dust from the Sahara.

Mr. Edwards: Good, but what I would like, ladies and gentlemen, is as many of you here who are available, let us all go on the site and look at it, nuh, just drive up there and look at the location and we will show you some things on the ground.

Lady: Is it a quarry zone. The question was never answered.

Mr. Edwards: I am going to respond to that, the section that is north west of it within where this area is going to be quarried, is part of the Rio Bueno quarry zone that was...

Ms. Lee: This is not in Trelawny this is...

Mr. Edwards: Wendy, this area...

Ms. Lee: You know me?

Mr. Edwards: Yuh nuh know me? What I am saying the Rio Bueno, the section that has been ear-marked for quarry is part of the Rio Bueno quarry zone. I thank you very much.

Mr. Sweet: We are going to give the phone back to Fiona.

Mrs. Evans: I understand that the formal results of your EIA showed that this area, the proposed quarry is critical to wild life. And I want to just ask our NEPA representatives here whether he and

his organization are truly serious about preventing species extinction.

Can I have a yes or no?

Mr. Sweet: Unfortunately, NEPA cannot respond.

Mrs. Evans: Okay CL can respond. Let's make an assumption though, let's assume that NEPA is serious about preventing species extinctions.

Mr. Hopwood: Why him cannot talk?

Mrs. Evans: ..preventing species extinction, let's make a wild assumption. NEPA, I am assuming also are serious about enforcing the Wildlife Protection Act and pertaining to International Standards such as the Conventional Biological Diversity and the International Union for Conservation of Nature. Now, I am very concerned that if this quarry goes ahead, Jamaica would be in contravention for

all of those policies and acts which I just mentioned.

Mr. Sweet: You mean all of Jamaica?

Mrs. Evans: The Jamaica - our environment protection agency will be in contravention because I assume that they sign them on behalf of our nation.

Mr. Sweet: But we cannot comment on NEPA's approval or methodology, I think that it can go on record and NEPA can respond.

Lady: They represent the government and they cannot make a comment, is NEPA gagged?

M. Hopwood: You must have gagged them.

Mr. Nelson: Remember the statement that I read, we are here to observe the process so as a part of the process this consultation is for the public to

raise questions, to the proponent and their consultants for them to respond. If you have a question in respect of the process and not in respect of the development like in terms of how the application is reviewed, or submitted and such, we can give that information. But we cannot bias the information, we cannot bias your views, the presentation made by the proponent. So, we are only here to observe. And since I am here and I am standing, I just want to say that if you speak all at once the Steno Writer cannot get the information and we will not have the information that we need to consider the thing properly. So I am asking as the Chairman did, that you identify yourselves, you ask your questions and allow them to respond. Thank you.

Mrs. Morris: Morris, I am a resident of the Queens Highway. Are we going to have access to the minutes?

Dr. Campbell: Yep.

Mrs. Morris: Of all that is happening here?

Dr Campbell: Yes, within seven days.

Mrs. Morris: Within seven days, where will we get it?

Dr Campbell: It will be on NEPA's website.

Mrs. Morris: And if we have any objection, any changes?

Dr. Campbell: That is why we have a Steno Writer who takes notes. If in case you have an issue, I am sure you can raise it with NEPA or you can contact me so that I can pass on the relevant information to NEPA. But I mean I have been doing it for years, she has worked with me, and I have not had an issue where persons said that their information

was not represented in these documents.

Mr. Sweet: You have a question back here, your name, sir.

Mr. Trench: Good afternoon everyone my name is Trench and I represented the Discovery Bay Marine Lab. I came with many concerns based on the EIA document, however, I believe the community members are quite vocal and are representing that very well so I don't need to go over the dust and the noise, and you are all experts, so let's forego that. One of our concerns is in terms of the fauna, we are not aware that animals like the Coney and the boa once moved will not try to get back to their native habitat. So, I am not so sure what are the mitigation steps to prevent this animal from going back; or these animals of which

I am quite sure there are quite a lot, going back into the area that is being quarried.

And number two, coming out of this discussion I believe that it seems as if the company has a plan eventually, even though they don't have an agreement with Tankweld to do export, I believe that the community should demand what impact it will have on the marine sector in seeing the impact that the bauxite company has and any other mining operation that put stuff near or into the water. The bauxite company has a conveyor system that dries the dust and there is still a fair amount of stuff that gets into the water. To be fair, there are planned development for places down in Rio Bueno which Rio Bueno has one of the most—in case you don't know, Rio Bueno is one of the best hands

down marine spaces in Jamaica. So you should demand what impact this propose, even though it may be further down the road, it is not being mentioned now, will have on the marine environment. Thank you very much.
(Applause)

Mr. Bryson: Thank you, Mr. Bryson again from Discovery Bay. Just one question, it is mentioned about two million tons per year or whatever okay...

Participant: Cubic yard.

Mr. Bryson: Cubic yard. Even with that, I am concerned about the wetting that you will be doing for dust suppression. And I mentioned two factors that would really make it very bad. My question is, where the source for your water to do all of that wetting, because four to six hours might not cut it, it might require a more frequent...

Mr. B. Smith: Excuse me, the port in dry harbour supports the people, it cannot cut it, the place is dry.

Mr Bryson: So my question is, water source what is your plan re that?

Lady: And the run-off?

Mr. Hopwood: Me nah sell you no water don't bother come to me for water because you are not getting no water from me. (Laughter) You not getting none from me so don't come to me.

Mr. Sweet: We plan to purchase the water and we plan to find many different sources to purchase the water. There is a question in the back, sir.

Mr. R. Smith: Rosary Smith is the name, Bengal Beach. Well, I have one question first and then I have a statement. Is anybody from TPDCo here or the Ministry Tourism? Okay, well we operate from Bengal Beach and I speak

on behalf of all in Bengal Beach. We operate tourism driven properties down there and this is specifically for the Steno Writer also, and minutes going to NEPA. We are one hundred per cent against any quarrying in any neighbouring community or any area that will impact our truism products that we have here and we need to protect that; and one hundred percent, Miss Steno Writer please, and stress on the point that **Bengal Beach is not interested in this development.**

Mr. Sweet: Can you, just before you give that statement, can I have your name again.

Mr. G. Smith: Gory Smith.

Mr. Sweet: This is a good point Gory, just to be fair. The sand from beaches comes from these types of operations.

Resident: Nooo.

Mr. Sweet: Let me finish, let me finish.

Mr. Hopwood: Stop your nonsense, him think an idiot inside here, you know.

Mr. Sweet: The construction for hotels comes from these types of operations.

Mr. Hopwood: They import sand from the Bahamas.

Mr. Sweet: Even with hotels, this type of business is integral to the hotel development.

Mr. Hopwood: Oh, really.

Lady: How is that possible?

Mr. Sweet: Mr. Smith, is that a fact or not a fact?

Mrs. Smith: Not a fact.

Mr. Sweet: I ask Mr. Smith.

Mrs. Smith: I am Mrs. Smith.

Mr. Sweet: Mrs. Smith is correct because I don't argue with Mrs. Smith. (Laughter)

There is a question here. State your name please, sir.

Mr. Holmes:

I am Anthony Holmes and I am the Chairman, of the Citizens Association Limited, most of our residents are here. I can assure you that...(Inaudible) I mean the whole thing has been a farce, your answers are not convincing at all, you will never get rid of the dust let alone the conservation aspect. There is something in the EIA you made various things like you will mitigate as far as possible about the removal that means absolutely nothing, we will use our best endeavour to mitigate as far as possible, that means nothing, we have confirmation. And as for the export you said there is no current agreement, I don't mean to say that there is agreement next week or wherever?

Mr Sweet: To answer that point directly sir, we don't have a crystal ball we don't have a current agreement.

Mr. Holmes: You do. You do. (Heckling)

Mr. Sweet: You heard directly from Tankweld we do not have a current agreement.

Mr. Holmes: You can have an agreement next week.

(Cross talk)

Mr. Holmes: Are you seeking an agreement with Tankweld for the export?

Mr. Sweet: This is a business and it sounds like a lot of people maybe anti this business but this is a business.

Participant: No, no.

Mr. Sweet: Let me finish. This business is market driven, okay, wherever there is a market we will participate in the market.

(Cross talk)

Participant: Take it somewhere else.

(Cross talk)

Participant: Bengal strip is market driven.

Mr. Sweet: And we absolutely don't want to destroy that, sir.

(Cross talk)

Mr. B Smith: Let the man in the white shirt speak.

Mr. Sweet: We need to pay respect, Wendy has the floor, let's give Wendy the floor.

Ms. Lee: We have been talking a lot about the impact on the residents, and we have not had as much emphasis on the loss of what is the last remaining pieces of original dry limestone forest on the North Coast of Jamaica. These are not my words; these are the Forestry Department. The Forestry Department in 2010 officially, their official statement was that we could not basically afford to lose any more

forest and that this was—I have it right here. The question is classified as tall open dry natural forest and has been recommended to be included in Jamaica's system of protected areas. It is also one of the last remaining dry limestone coastal forest on the North Coast. The area has significant amount of endemic flora and fauna, so all talk of rehabilitation and restoration is nonsense and, and you stated it Mr. Sweet, your ultimate goal is to develop that beautiful cliff, the beautiful cliff, that we all want to keep as a natural forest to enhance the beauty of our coastline and to have all the wild life, the birds and everything in it. And I don't trust your evaluation when you go there for one or two days, NEPA required in 2010 the previous application was not

allowed, it was the required detailed study. You cannot go there in two days and make a list and some of the things you found to be on it, some of the birds on it you don't ever find in Jamaica ever. So, I don't trust those results. The giant king bird comes from some little piece in northern Cuba never seen in Jamaica before.

Lady: Put it on record that you are contesting the EIA.

Ms. Lee: Yes, I have a number of things in the integrity of the EIA, of the formal assessment and also the goals of this project are atypical to the stated planning requirements for this area, and the historical recommendation for this area to be protected for its wild life, bio-diversity and stunning landscape which all enhance the existing businesses of all the people

in this room that are depending on tourism, the marine lab that they use the areas for scientific research, all of that has been completely under played or not even mentioned in your EIA, it is not acceptable. (Applause)

Participants: Hear! Hear!

Mr. B. Smith: Excuse me, sir, could I have your name and your relation to the whole...?

Dr. Campbell: Okay, my name is Dr Carlton Campbell...

Participants: Not you.

Mr. B Smith: Dr. Campbell go ahead I want to—and you are the environmental person?

Dr Campbell: I am responsible for the environmental EIA - yes.

Mr. B Smith: But, Dr. Campbell, how come no one has come down to Bengal Beach or along the Queens Highway or Discovery Bay. If it was not for this lady we would not know about this crap, you know? If it

was not for Wendy here, we would not have known about it.

Mr. Hopwood: I would like to know who him talk to up there?

Mr B Smith: What I want to know is that, how everything is just going over our heads like that?

Dr Campbell: In terms of what?

Mr. B Smith: In terms of what I see in front of me, and a presentation. You know when you made your presentation you made it sound like it was accepted because you a tell me, how de truck dem gwaan run and where dem going to run and what bathrooms will be in place, that is establish. I cannot believe that we didn't know anything about this. And you make it sound like it is something that is happening, and it is established, and we don't know

nothing about it and it is happening in our back yard, why is that so?

Dr. Campbell: In terms of the establishing, meaning what? In terms of the roads?

Mr. B. Smith: Not the roads, the general...

Participant: Everything.

Dr Campbell: But the project—if you understand the process, Mr. Smith, a proponent comes with a project, this is what you want to do this is the area. We look at it, look at what they plan to do. Based on their information we look at what the issues are and look at what the potential impacts are, and see if and how we can mitigate them. So that is what the process is. In terms, of you in Bengal not hearing, I have to apologize and ask...

(Cross talk)

We had asked someone to go and do a thorough...

(Cross talk)

Remember a survey is a percentage of the person. You are not going to find a survey to do every single door.

(Cross talk)

Participant: No, no, you are getting too disrespectful to us I went and brought a water heater at ATL yesterday...

Dr Campbell: There is a process, sir...

Participant: And the lady said remember me, we have ATL coming door to door to all the villas offering to sell things to us and you doing a project like this and nobody don't know this. As far as I see, it is only persons of a certain socio economic background I see here.

Dr. Campbell: I am sorry you feel that way.

Participant: And it is unfair.

Mr. Hopwood: Dr. Campbell, you are a doctor, doctor of what? What kind of a Doctor...

Mr. Campbell: Environmental Biologist, sir.

Mr. Hopwood: You have a PhD in Doctor?

Dr. Campbell: Yes, not to write a prescription, but an Environmental Biologist.

Mr Hopwood: And you are approving something like this? You want to approve something like this?

Dr. Campbell: We don't approve, we give the pros and cons and we have said, we have laid out in our documents our thoughts.

Mr. Hopwood: You sound like you done plan already.

(Cross talk)

Mr. B. Smith: You have not intervened one single person in this room. Your document is flawed.

(Cross talk)

Dr. Campbell: Hold on, I am not the one who did the interview you know.

Lady: Who did?

(Cross talk)

Dr. Campbell: It is at the back of the document.

The Chairman: I want to say for the benefit of the process, we have to speak in a way that it can be recorded. So far we have moved away from questions.

Participants: No, no.

The Chairman: I said we have moved away from it and I want us to get back to it. So please; we are going to have to stop at a certain point.

Mr. B Smith: Boy we could go all night.

The Chairman: I am going to come back to you.

Mr. Hopwood: The land value gwain go down...

The Chairman: I want to give preference to somebody who has not yet asked a question, and

I will come back to you, I will come immediately back to you after that lady behind you, please go ahead.

Mrs. Hopwood: Thank you very much my name is Hopwood, I am married to the man that does not need a microphone. (Laughter) I understand that there is an archaeological impact assessment, standalone document could I see that document please?

Dr. Campbell: I don't have it on me.

Mr. Hopwood: Where it is?

Mrs. Hopwood: Is it available?

Dr. Campbell: Yes it is available.

Mrs Hopwood: Could it be e-mailed to me?

Dr. Campbell: Yes, after the meeting you could give me the e-mail.

Participant: Why was it left out?

Dr. Campbell: No, it is not left out it is a standalone...

Lady: You should come armed with everything.

Dr. Campbell: No, I don't have to. I stated it in here that it is a presentation, as stated in the summary in there about Jamaica National Heritage Trust, I did state it, if you want to see the details I have no problem.

Mr. B. Smith: Doc as an environmental man you know, I am kind of surprise that you get involved in something like this in terms of the impact it is going to have on the environment. And you are more than capable man I know you cannot write a prescription me understand that.

Dr. Campbell: Mr. Smith you also have—I think a lot of persons have missed—how I should I put it, have not thought about this, I know you are emotional...

Participant: Nooo.

Dr. Campbell: Emotional might not be the word, but what is the word, 'passionate' that is the word, 'passionate' and I understand, and I am not going to dispute that, but you also have to understand from the proponents part that...

Mr. B. Smith: Why?

Dr. Campbell: Why? If you Mr. Smith, you quarry, you have ten acres right...?

Mr. B Smith: A three hundred me have.

Dr. Campbell: Fine, thank you sir, my apology. Three hundred acres and if I came to you and say Mr. Smith you are in the quarrying business you can't quarry on your three hundred acres what will you say?

LADY: Use renewable energy.

Dr. Campbell: What would you say?

Participant: Don't answer.

Mr. B. Smith: No sir, me a talk, me have my own mike. First thing first, I have 300 acres and so far I only mine 20 or 30 acres alright fine. But let me tell you this I am mining, I am not impacting on anybody because me inna waan bush. Now you are on the main.

Dr. Campbell: We are not going to be on the main.

(Cross talk)

Mr. B Smith: (Inaudible) and we have no environmental problem Doc...

(Cross talk)

Dr. Campbell: It seems that the quarry is a means to an end. I hear you with the renewables how are you going to place those renewables in that location?

Mrs. Smith: So you give me the mike now. I am going to spill it out now. Renewables you have a perfect hillside you can shape it how you want and take off as

minimal as you need minimal as you need and you can stay within Jamaica. You said you do not have an agreement with Tankweld, have you approached PAJ, Mr. Sweet?

Mr Sweet: What was the question?

Mrs. Smith: You do not have an agreement with Tankweld, have you approached PAJ?

Mr. Sweet: No.

Mrs. Smith: Which port have you approached for export?

Mr. Sweet: We have never approached any port.

Mr. B Smith: For a man of this magnitude, a business of this magnitude, coming to local business? A rubbish that man. The size of this conglomerate does not come to do business in Jamaica.

Mrs. Smith: You mentioned sink holes, was a watershed study done? You mentioned sink

holes, was a water shed study done?
Talk to me about leaching?

Dr. Campbell: In terms of sink holes we looked at, the geologist looked at sink holes but as you will appreciate there are no streams on that side, so any leaching would be from the operation of the quarry. And as you notice, I had laid out, how we intend to put the sediments basins which would be seen also the drainage around so that we don't get that into the sink hole.

(Cross talks)

Mr. Hopwood: Hey Doctor when the sediment pond full what unnu going to do with the water?

(Cross talk)

Mr. B Smith: Chairman, I would like to address the...

Lady: Was the swamp area assessed?

Dr. Campbell: We did water quality in that area.

Lady: Where are the water quality cycle, the monitoring of the quarry..

Dr. Campbell: For the EIA there is monitoring done in said location, you will see it in the document including on the river and in the swamp. But if and when the permit is issued then an environmental monitoring plan would have to be developed and approved by NEPA.

Mr. Sweet: Fiona, you are going to have to share the mike a little bit. Is that possible?

Mrs. Evans: No, I have been waiting.

Mrs. Smith: Sir, this question is for you again. Your plan is market driven no business proposal come to us with a market definition, what is your market definition? You keep telling us a hundred per cent market driven, where

is your market and don't go around me, place.

Mrs. B Smith: Where is your market? The Chairman of the organization should answer that question.

Mr. Sweet: Well, first of all I am the co-founder of the business okay.

Mr. B. Smith: You are a millionaire you know, you.
(Laughter)

Mr. Sweet: Our representative from ESPA is a service provider okay, he provides the service.

Mr. B. Smith: Who, the Chairman?

Dr. Campbell: The Chairman for the meeting.

(Cross talk)

Mr. Sweet: The Chairman of the meeting is moderating the meeting. But to answer Mrs. Smith's question directly, market driven means wherever the

business is that 'is where we are trying to go.

Mrs. Smith: So where have you determined the business; you would not come and invest billions of dollars if you don't know where your market...

Mr. Sweet: Exactly, and we are with the booming construction market in Jamaica.

Participant: Really.

Mr. Sweet: You know what is funny to me...

Mrs. Smith: So why is your proposal...

(Cross talk)

Mr. Sweet: Our proposal shows a road going to the port, but we have no agreement to export.

Mrs. Smith: I want you to define your market, not market driven.

Mr. Sweet: Local market and eventually export market.

Mrs. Smith: To where?

Participants: Aaah.

Mrs. Smith: To where?

(Cross talk)

Participant: You cannot have one person to dominate the questions like that.

(Cross talk)

Mrs. Evans: I am questioning the validity of the EIA sir, I think I should direct my question to CL Environmental. Do you consider that your bat evaluation is okay, I am contesting the validity of the EIA, directed at CL Environment and I would like to you ask whether you consider your bat evaluations were thorough and rigorous using the correct professional equipment?

Mr. B Smith: Go deh Doc, meck a hear that.

Mr. Whyte: Alright, evening my name is Damion Whyte, Ecologist here I am responding

to two questions here. The first goes to Wendy. When she mentioned about the Giant King bird that might have been an error. She knows that as fellow birders errors can be made on it. So, we accept that.

(Sotto voce comments)

Mr. Sweet: Is it an error on our part or an error on the comment?

Mr. Whyte: She is just contesting that she sees the Blackpoll Warbler...

(Inaudible)

Mr. Whyte: And I can contest that and you know that all of them don't leave at the same time. The second question you asked about the bats which is a pretty good question. NEPA asked is that when you are doing the bat assessment they don't want a consultant to handle the bats so they normally recommend that first when you go to the area and you

find a key spots where there are bats like caves or sink holes where they are seen coming out. The assessment when it was carried out for the main project area, we did that. It states that when you are doing surveys like that you can miss some spots.

Mrs. Evans: Did you did an overnight?

Participant: You slept in the bush?

Mr. Whyte: Yes.

Mrs. Evans: How many nights?

Mr. Whyte: Aaam, I think we did three to four nights. And the thing is, you have there were two teams that went through this, they went through the process the first time and then they went back to do the work and then we came in and did some of the work. We did not find any area where we saw any cave or sink holes in the area, although it is stated in the EIA document that when

you are doing further clearing you could meet a sink hole like a small spot.

Mrs. Evans: Okay, (inaudible) ...the piece of land that we are talking about, it is a known roost for the Jamaican flower bat which is critically in danger?

Mr. Whyte: Well the thing with the flower bat, we were told when you are doing the surveys if we see any of those bats, I should say when you do it in the day time if we see any of them roosting in the trees, when we did the survey we did not observe anything like that.

Mrs. Evans: Your EIA states that there were Jamaica flower bats?

Mr. Whyte: Jamaican fruit Bat.

Mrs. Evans: No, I have been speaking with Doctor of forestry and the environmental studies I have been living down here.. (inaudible)

Mr. Whyte: Suzanne and I do most of the bat assessment she is my colleague...

Mrs. Evans: I am very concern with the EIA, it was not handled—correct professional equipment was not used.

Mr. Whyte: Let's go back to it. What NEPA requires is in the terms of reference is the presence/absence is that you should be able to see the bat. The equipment that you are asking for, if we use stuff like nets or if you have bat acoustic equipment out there, we did not, it was mainly to find areas where they were roosted sorry, like cave or stuff like that; that was part of the Study. Next question when you say Jamaica flower bat if you are using common names if you are talking about Phyllonycteris it is critically endangered, if it is the Jamaican fruit bat you are talking about...

Lady: The flower bat.

Mr Whyte: And you find any - you have that it
in that document?

(Inaudible)

Mr. Hopwood: That is in trouble.

Mr. Whyte: Let's get it right, the bat that you
are talking about, the flower bat, the
typically endangered flower bat it is
only found in one cave right now. Can
I get to that, it is only found in one
cave right now and that is the Stony
Hill Cave in Portland where we are
doing the work? The other cave that
it might have been in, is Green
Grotto.

(Inaudible)

And I am just coming from a survey
from Green Grotto so I can respond.

Mrs. Evans: I am just confirming that the bats is along this corridor which is the proposed mining land.

Mr. Whyte: I wouldn't say that, let's put it this way, we have the overall mitigation right here. The bats would perch in the general area.

Mrs. Evans: Which would be detrimental to the bats if the fauna were moved from the hillside as well. (Inaudible)

Mr. Whyte: Let me state something here, the bat that you are talking about is only confirmed right now in Stony Hill Cave we have not - wait because the question that I have been told here that I have been led to state is that we have that bat perching in the area. And I am stating that Green Grotto is a possible place and the bat would be in the Coral Springs mountain and also so bats are perching in the area, so

the first thing that you would have to clear, please do not make the statement that phyllonycteris is present in Rio Bueno.

Mrs. Evans: That is a very good chance it is. Dr. Hans-Ulrich Schnitzier in 2005 cited that bat were seen...

Mr. Whyte: But as stated in your document that you said we have that phyllonycteris is there, we could not because...

Mrs. Evans: No, I was quoting your document.

The Charmin: No, we have to move on.

Mr. Whyte: Let me be clear so that everybody understands what I am talking about.

Mrs. Evans: In 2005 it is cited that...
(Inaudible)

Mr. Whyte: What you stated before that everybody have minuted there is that during the EIA that very critical endanger bats

is there, it is not being confirmed there.

(Inaudible)

The Chairman: I am sorry this line of conversation, we have to move on. Fiona, for the benefit of the recorder, please we are just kindly asking again that we utilize the microphone thank you very much.

Dr. Garraway: I am Eric Garraway, I did part of the work on this project. Let me say upfront there were other work done before I came in, I came in at the very end, and therefore they would not have been part of my work. A couple of things, Wendy said that we have not spoken a lot about the flora and fauna that is a problem. Once you remove the natural forest the animals, the plants the animals there are going to suffer that is a given. It means,

therefore, that we have to decide as a people what we are willing to give and what we want to keep that is simple reality. I (Inaudible) a house in the blue mountains, I chose a piece of land and I build a house, the animals there are going to suffer, I have to decide how much I am allowed to keep, or how much I want to keep, that is the reality. If the animals out there are going to suffer the answer is yes, because we are going to break down their houses and that happens when all of us build our houses, simple, good. We found some interesting things, and we made it clear what we found. For example, I found a butterfly which I had not seen for years and I put it in and I said to the developers what is this thing, we have not seen this thing since 1922, so we put it in. And we

responded they said we must go back and find out more. They did respond to us and we went back and we are looking at the thing up to today. I still stop there every time I travel along there. We found it interestingly, a year later the butterfly showed up everywhere, it showed up in my back yard at Mona, this was flying all over Caymanas, you look at Turner's book of butterflies, this thing showed up everywhere. So, don't ask me why we don't know why we are not a butterfly. But I can tell you, when we saw it, we said his is a butterfly. I said listen guys, this thing is here. But Jermy from Discovery Bay Marine Laboratory had recorded the thing along the whole coast and Brandon Hays recorded it further west. We said this is the status of it that is what we do. Now

NEPA all we have to say, where are the various populations located, and what are we willing to give up as a people? That is where we come in. The situation of the birds... (Inaudible) ...Kingbird rather than a (Inaudible) Kingbird... (Inaudible)

Lady: You cannot have (Inaudible) Kingbird in January either it is summer migrant that is a ... (Inaudible) King Bird

Dr. Garraway: But the thing is guys, the safe reality is we are going to lose some sites, we are going to lose some sites...

Mr. B Smith: We don't want to lose any at all, you are not from here.

Dr. Garraway: All I am saying is, if this site, if this project comes...

(Cross talk)

Dr. Garraway: Can I just finish please. I drove from Kingston I sat here...

Participant: You don't live here.

Mr. B Smith: Do you agree with that part? Do you agree with that part? You don't live here do you agree with starting a quarry?

Dr. Garraway: I have a role, I put the data there, I say to you there is a butterfly there. You have to use that data, NEPA has to use that data. I am not going to be judged I say to you, this is the evidence you can use it, NEPA can use it, it is what you do with it.

Mr. B. Smith: Is it rich vibrant fauna?

Dr. Garraway: Of course it is. So all I am saying is the reality on the ground is, in any development you are going to lose something. You have to decide, you have to make a case against NEPA what you want to do lose or not.

(Cross talk)

The Chairman: We are wrapping up now friends,
question from my right.

Lady: I will be quick. The gentleman in the
plaid shirt thank you for your point,
I totally agree with you. Your job is
to record, document, do an assessment
of the situation and not to advocate
on the part of the project and not to
be bias in any way. I am not sure that
everybody on your team is following
the same role. My one question that I
have is to the room. Could you please
raise your hands if you were consulted
during the survey? Will the Steno
Writer please record that nobody
raised their hands? So that NEPA and
the NRCA can use that information
however they wish.

And my last point is, to come back to
the question of this gentleman, in the

blue hat, I forgot his name. I do not feel that his question got an adequate answer which is, where will the water come from since this is the main mitigation measure for the project?

Mr. Sweet: We will be purchasing the water.

Participant: Where?

Lady: This is an existential part of the mitigation measures. Have you put any thought into where the water is coming from?

Mr. Sweet: We will be purchasing the water.

Participant: Where?

Mr. Sweet: Multiple suppliers.

Participants: Who?

Lady: Have you gotten the water supply market, where you might get this volume of water for twenty years?

Mr. Sweet: We will be purchasing from multiple suppliers.

Participants: Where?

Mr. Sweet: We know for sure it won't be Mr Hopwood.

Mr. Hopwood: No, it won't be me.

Lady: And one more thing, just for the record. Would anybody who is in favour of this development raise their hands? Just for the Steno Wrter, thank you.

(No hands were raised)

Mr. Hopwood: Mr. Bryson are you in favour of it?

Mr Bryson: No, no this question is very important for me. You know, I want to know when you finish with this, all of this what will it look like? Can you give us some kind of pictorial, what will this look like? So at least I can rest in peace?

Participant: Don't say that.

(Cross talk)

Lady:

My question is, I have employees at my villa, when I was speaking to them in this area in the Rio Bueno, none of them absolutely none of them come to and asked us. You notice there is nobody here, nobody from Rio Bueno knows about this meeting or the quarry that you guys are planning to do, nobody knows. So don't come and tell me that you went out and spoke and told them, and fliers this, that is crap. You guys have your little secret thing, you put your little thing in the paper this big, because that is what you are bound to do by law. And if it was not for Wendy this meeting would have been empty. This gentleman and that gentleman, and MR Tankweld over there and the Steno Writer, this room would have been empty and that is what you are striving for. So that you had your town meeting, nobody

came, on and upward we go with our plan.

Mr. Hopwood: Very true, well said. (Applause)

Dr. Campbell: This was raised before and I said to you that I made arrangements, it was raised in the meeting that is what I said. And I apologize if I did not get to your location.

(Cross talk)

But if you look at what we had done in terms of the regulation, in terms of advertising the meeting.

Participant: Aaah.

Dr. Campbell: We did.

Mr. Morgan: My name is Que Morgan; the distinct difference is that I have seen both sides of the fence. I have one question for the developers. In all your plans, what you find is evaluation of each process. Everybody

here has a stake and nobody has addressed that. What you are willing to do based on the 20 year plan to compensation all these owners for their loses?

Mr. B. Smith: Gwaan Sweet, give we a talk there Sweet.

Mr. Sweet: We actually pick the contrary right. We think that the ultimate plan that we laid out in the first step which we all seem to be, or most of us in the room seem to be advertise to, but the first step is integral in developing the property which will then increase..

(Cross talk)

...in order to build and develop residential, commercial and alternative energy which will bring the community energy..

(Cross talk)

...and by the way, it sounds like most of the people in this room are not looking for a job, however, the jobs that are going to be provided..

(Cross talk)

I hope I answer your questions directly.

(Cross talk)

We have one more question, we have time for one more question.

Mr. R. Smith: Rory Smith, Bengal Beach and Discovery Bay and you are going to affect both of my locations. When you speak of the jobs that you will provide the impact, the negative impact that you will have on the tourism product that we have between Rio Bueno and Discovery Bay you will shut down way more jobs than you can ever produce. You do not realize or you are pretending not to realize the

value or the volume of the tourism product that exist between Rio Bueno and Discovery Bay.

(Cross talk)

Mr. Sweet: We understand fully the value of the tourism along the coast, because we plan to sell a lot of our aggregates to a lot of those..

(Cross talk)

Participant: We have enough and we don't need no more aggregate.

Mr. Sweet: I think that is all the time that we have for questions.

Thank you everyone.

The Chairman: That was the final question, however, in closing I say to you, the process is by no means ended this maybe one part of the process.

Lady: Would be so kind as to outline the process for us?

Dr. Campbell: The gentleman from NEPA had outlined the process for us.

Mr. Nelson: Alright, what we have, we have an application that was submitted by Bengal Development Limited, they were advised that they would need do an EIA, they did the EIA. They were advised that they need to present their findings of the EIA to the public that is this meeting. Seven days from now or before seven days from now, they would be required to submit the verbatim notes from this meeting. The Steno Writer is here and that is why we are also here so that we can verify, yes we take notes, so that we can verify what they submit. But the notes from the meeting will also be posted to the agency's website so you can verify that the notes are in keeping with what you observed.

You have all members here and anybody else, so you can tell anybody. You have 21 days, 21 days to submit comments.

Mr. Hopwood: To submit what?

Mr. Nelson: Twenty-one days to submit comments. So what you said here will form part of the official records right. But, if there was anything that you didn't consider while here, if you have friends that bring something else to you that you want to be considered, you can send that and I am going to tell you the e-mail address again. It is not hard applications@nepa.gov.jm.

Lady: Is that the only recourse, 21 days in which to send an e-mail to you. We need another meeting.

Mr. Nelson: No, no, I cannot right here now speak about whether or not there will be another meeting right. If you

residents, persons here feel it necessary, that is something that you can put forward to that e-mail address, you can call however you want to get information there.

Lady: Can we request it now?

Mr. Nelson: You said it so, it is on the record. If there is another meeting just to say that all the comments, what you said here in the meeting, whatever—we have gotten comments in writing already before the meeting and any comments that will come after the meeting, all of that including the findings of the EIA, that all will be put forward to the various committees. Now, the EIA has also been circulated to other relevant regulatory agencies to consider the findings and to make their recommendations on the proposal. So

that will include the Mines and Geology, the Water Resources Authority and so on. Also, one of the meetings that the application will be considered at is what we call a technical review committee which has representatives from all these other agencies as well right. So the decision will be considered collectively and they will also have the information that was—the questions, the concerns, the comments that were raised here, okay. And then finally, it will go to the authority for the authority to deliberate and make a decision.

Mr. Hopwood: Who is the authority?

Mr. Nelson: The times, the only times that are set are the times for the submission of the verbatim notes and the times for the submission of the comments. In

terms of the meetings, meetings are held every month, but it depends on how it progresses. You asked for another meeting, I cannot say if there will be another meeting that will shift the time. So those times are not set. But what is set is the time for the submission of the notes, and the time for the submission of the comments, Okay. The authority, sorry, I speak about the authority because the authority is the Natural Resources Conservation Authority and the authority is appointed by the Minister and, that authority is established under the Natural Resources Conservation Authority Act, Right. Thank you much.

Participants: Are there rights of appeal?

Mr. Nelson: Yes, there are rights of appeal, I do not know off the top my head they are

outlined in the legislation. But you can put that—ask that question and I can provide a response, okay.

Residents: Thank you very much.

The Chairman: Thank you friends for your commitment to Jamaica, thank you for your commitment to Discovery Bay, to Bengal. Thank you for responding to this invite to share in this process. I hasten to say to you, there would have been some important matters raised that would not have been documented, because the Steno Writer would not have been able to hear based on some things that took place. So those who made some comments that were vital to the outcome of the process, please take the 21-day period and within that timeframe write a notation.

Just so that nothing gets lost, good.

God bless you, have a wonderful evening.

Participants: Thank you.

The Chairman: This meeting is terminated.

Adjournment taken 8:20 p.m.